

**Project Evaluation Series**

**Final evaluation of the project  
“Strengthening resilience to climate  
change through integrated agricultural  
and pastoral management in the Sahelian  
zone in the framework of Mali's  
Sustainable Land Management approach”**

**Project code: GCP/MLI/038/LDF  
GEF ID: 4822**

**Follow-up report**

Final evaluation of the project “Strengthening resilience to climate change through integrated agricultural and pastoral management in the Sahelian zone in the framework of Mali’s Sustainable Land Management approach” - Follow-up report					11/2022
Evaluation recommendation	Management response <b>Accepted,</b> <b>Partially accepted or</b> <b>Rejected</b>	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken
<p><b>Recommendation 1.</b> <b>To FAO and ESDA, with high importance.</b></p> <p>Advocate for the institutionalisation of the APFS approach.</p> <p>In order to address the uncertain stability of stakeholders within certain structures (especially within the technical services providing the active APFS facilitators), the project should seek from the Ministry of Agriculture an institutionalisation of the APFS approach, which is a particularly effective extension tool for building resilience to climate change.</p>	<b>Accepted</b>	<p>Accompany and support the DNA, which has begun the process of reviewing its texts to address their outdatedness. To this end, two series of workshops, held in March and April 2019, respectively, recommended this review to take into account certain topics including climate change, among others, and the FFS/APFS agriculture and life-skills for young people approaches in the National Agricultural Advisory System. This process of reflection launched continued until the creation of decision N°2109-OO606/MA-SG of the Minister of Agriculture, establishing and arranging the operating modalities of the Steering Committee for the process of beginning the review.</p> <p>For this agricultural campaign, the DNA has already planned to set up a thousand FFS/APFS. Since 2019, it has been advocating with certain other partners.</p> <p>The agropastoral field school approach is used in other projects of the FAO Mali as well as other development partners’ and is included in the curriculum of the Faculty of Agronomy and Animal Medicine in Segou. For the process to be successful, it will be necessary to closely involve the other sectoral ministries concerned, such as the Ministry of</p>	<p>The institutionalisation process launched was interrupted by the political and security crisis, the consequences of COVID-19 and the effects of the ECOWAS and WAEMU embargo.</p> <p>Supporting the improvement or suspension of measures, the institutionalisation has taken a first step forward through the development of the National Policy for the Agricultural Advisory System and its related strategy (in line with the Agricultural Orientation Law) that will take into account the APFS approach (a roadmap was approved during an enlarged Cabinet meeting and a consulting firm, which will be recruited to this end, is intended to deliver these outputs by the end of 2023).</p> <p>Nevertheless, at the national level, a National Field School Network is being set up while, at the regional level, the Regional Farmer Field School Network for West and Central Africa (R-CEP-AOC) is set up under the presidency of Mali.</p>	Advancing	<p>Advocacy activities carried out since 2019 among development stakeholders enhanced the ownership of the APFS approach among all TFPs, agro-pastoralist organisations, non-governmental organisations, projects and programmes.</p> <p>Institutionalisation at community level (grassroots) continues in all major agricultural production areas.</p> <p>Currently, the institutionalisation of the APFS approach from the grassroots (community level) is very advanced. All major development</p>

Final evaluation of the project "Strengthening resilience to climate change through integrated agricultural and pastoral management in the Sahelian zone in the framework of Mali's Sustainable Land Management approach" - Follow-up report					11/2022
Evaluation recommendation	Management response <b>Accepted,</b> <b>Partially accepted</b> or <b>Rejected</b>	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken
		Livestock and Fisheries and the Ministry of the Environment, Water and Sanitation.	The R-CEP-AOC aims at promoting farmer field schools within the Network member countries in order to enhance sustainable food security and living conditions of rural and urban populations.		programmes (MERIT, GEF project "Paysages résilients productifs et durables dans la région de Kayes", the PAESOL Programme for the promotion of agroecological crop systems and soil protection funded by KfW, LuxDev, FAO projects (Sweden, Canada, etc.) PRAPS, Enabel, GIZ, various NGOs, APFS Networks and farmer organisations, etc.).
<p><b>Recommendation 2.</b> <b>To national structures (DNA, DNPIA), FAO, with high importance.</b></p> <p>Build the capacities of VSLA members.</p> <p>The project has facilitated the setup of 42 VSLAs practising financial intermediation. The staff of these VSLAs needs to be more structured and trained to promote effective and efficient governance of resources in order to</p>	<b>Accepted</b>	<p>FAO plans to integrate support for VSLAs into its various projects, providing capacity building, including to the VSLAs of this project.</p> <p>FAO will advocate to DNA and DNPIA for the mobilization of resources in order to strengthen the capacities of the established VSLAs, to develop a management strategy for VSLAs, and to support networking between the FFS and VSLAs.</p>	<p>The VSLAs are integrated into FAO resilience projects implemented by national structures (DNA, DNPIA). A focus is put on capacity building for VSLA members in financial management and bookkeeping.</p> <p>The agents monitor the VSLAs set up and the fund situation is regularly reported through the WhatsApp link created.</p>	Excellent	The VSLA established supported the self-promotion of agro-pastoralists who have maintained the activity after the project's closure, which enables them to have a timely access to seeds for agricultural activities,

Final evaluation of the project "Strengthening resilience to climate change through integrated agricultural and pastoral management in the Sahelian zone in the framework of Mali's Sustainable Land Management approach" - Follow-up report					11/2022
Evaluation recommendation	Management response <b>Accepted,</b> <b>Partially accepted</b> or <b>Rejected</b>	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken
ensure their sustainability. Some members need to be trained in simplified bookkeeping and financial statements. The evaluation acknowledges that the project is nearing completion. FAO can advocate to the DNA and DNPIA in relation to capacity building of the VSLAs.			The VSLAs have been integrated into the project "Paysages résilients productifs et durables dans la région de Kayes" that DNA is to implement with its partners.		to face social expenses (weddings, expenses related to school for children, deaths, baptisms, etc.), to generate incomes through income generating activities (fattening, poultry-farming, market gardening, seed production, etc.).  Governance was improved within the VSLAs and, at their own requests, a lot of villages in the neighbourhood set up VSLAs as a result of the enhancement of their capacities by APFS facilitators.
<b>Recommendation 3.</b> <b>To national structures (DNA, DNPIA),</b> <b>FAO, with moderate importance.</b>	<b>Accepted</b>	FAO will advocate to DNA and DNPIA to capitalize on the developed local adaptation strategies.	Adaptation strategies made available by FAO to the structures have been capitalized and included into the repository of agropastoral resilient	Excellent	These strategies enabled national structures to strengthen the

Final evaluation of the project "Strengthening resilience to climate change through integrated agricultural and pastoral management in the Sahelian zone in the framework of Mali's Sustainable Land Management approach" - Follow-up report					11/2022
Evaluation recommendation	Management response <b>Accepted,</b> <b>Partially accepted or</b> <b>Rejected</b>	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken
<p>Strengthen the various measures for implementing local adaptation strategies.</p> <p>For a better integration of locally implemented measures, it is important to build the capacities of VSLA members in the processing and preservation of agricultural and animal products. The evaluation acknowledges that the project is nearing completion. FAO can seek the capitalisation of the local adaptation strategies developed from DNA and DNPIA.</p>		<p>In accordance with their institutional missions, the DNA and the DNPIA will continue to strengthen the measures for implementing local adaptation strategies through various training courses to strengthen the capacities of agro-pastoralists.</p>	<p>good practices, including the processing and preservation of agricultural and animal products, as for example liquid compost production from cow manure and neem leaves, nutritional blocks production, conservation of tomatoes (tomato puree), conservation of shallots, etc.</p> <p>These strategies have been capitalized in several projects and programmes and have helped or still contribute to capacity building of thousands of agro-pastoralists across the country:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. The LuxDEV programme (for rural development and food security MLI/021);</li> <li>ii. The AREPKA Project ("Appui au renforcement de l'élevage et de l'économie pastorale dans la région de Koulikoro"): technical training of 24 master-trainers and their support/animation for the setting up of country field schools for cattle and sheep fattening;</li> <li>iii. The Project "Appui à la résilience, la sécurité alimentaire et</li> </ol>		<p>resilience capacities of many agro-pastoralists to the effects and variations of climate change and consequently to maintain or to enhance the level of their agro-pastoral production and productivity.</p> <p>These provisions will be further strengthened through various projects integrating APFSs in the next 5 or 10 years.</p>

Final evaluation of the project "Strengthening resilience to climate change through integrated agricultural and pastoral management in the Sahelian zone in the framework of Mali's Sustainable Land Management approach" - Follow-up report					11/2022
Evaluation recommendation	Management response <b>Accepted,</b> <b>Partially accepted</b> or <b>Rejected</b>	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken
			<p>nutritionnelle"</p> <p>UNJP/MLI/057/CAN in the Bandiagara and Segou regions;</p> <p>iv. The MERIT Project "Multi-énergies pour la résilience et la gestion intégrée des terroirs" which has just been launched;</p> <p>v. The PAESOL Programme for the promotion of agroecological crop systems and soil protection funded by KfW;</p> <p>vi. The Project "Paysages résilients productifs et durables dans la région de Kayes", etc.</p>		
<p><b>Recommendation 4.</b></p> <p><b>To the Project Team, FAO and ESDA, with high importance.</b></p> <p>Organize a national workshop on land tenure issues after project closure.</p> <p>Equitable access to land is an essential component of land tenure security. Collaboration between stakeholders, including the State, the project, communities and chambers of agriculture, does not seem to provide a significant response to the land tenure issue in the project intervention area,</p>	<b>Partially accepted</b>	<p>The project team will no longer be in place by the end of June.</p> <p>A national workshop bringing together the different actors (FAO, communities, regional authorities, rural technical services, Office du Niger, etc.) with the aim to tackle the problem of the acquisition of plots for FFS is possible.</p>	<p>FAO and the sectorial departments with their divisions addressed general land tenure issues in Mali through different thematic workshops.</p> <p>Specifically for APFSs, issues related to the access to land are facilitated by local authorities, APFS networks or extension officers.</p> <p>Currently, the strategy of allocating 15 % of developed land to women and young people is promoted through the programme/project approach. This provision is valid for the Office du</p>	Advancing	<p>Advocacy activities carried out by APFS networks led to grant several plot administrative titles to APFS members who eventually established associations.</p> <p>Land tenure commissions (COFO) set up, as well as administration and local authorities,</p>

Final evaluation of the project “Strengthening resilience to climate change through integrated agricultural and pastoral management in the Sahelian zone in the framework of Mali’s Sustainable Land Management approach” - Follow-up report					11/2022
Evaluation recommendation	Management response <b>Accepted,</b> <b>Partially accepted</b> or <b>Rejected</b>	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken
particularly in the Niono area and the area covered by the Office du Niger. For the continuity and sustainability of participatory learning, APFS must have spaces dedicated to demonstrations. The ongoing process of acquiring plots is not effective and most APFS do not have their own plots. To facilitate the acquisition of these plots, the evaluation team recommends that a national workshop bringing together the various stakeholders (FAO, Project, communities, regional authorities, rural technical services, Office du Niger, etc.) should be organized in order to address the problem and find solutions.			Niger regarding any new land development.		contribute to the implementation of the Law on agricultural land tenure (Loi n° 2017-01 du 11 avril 2017 portant sur le foncier agricole) in Mali.
<b>Recommendation 5.</b> <b>To the project team, FAO, GEF and ESDA, with moderate importance.</b> Draw lessons from the weakness and difficulties in mobilising co-financing. Co-financing as provided for in the Project Document was not effective. Although co-financing letters were drawn up, none of these commitments were respected. In addition, the stakeholders concerned do not seem to understand GEF’s co-financing policy.	<b>Partially accepted</b>	Carrying out a study in order to document the blocking factors of co-financing and to draw lessons from it before the end of the project on June 30 is not feasible. However, starting at the design stage of GEF projects, FAO will have to ensure that the co-financing partners are reinforced in all its aspects. FAO will also have to develop a strategy for the participation of partners in co-financing which will involve:  i. presenting the project idea and sharing it with the main partners;	Due to the lack of study, lessons were drawn from the implementation of previous projects. This helped FAO to develop a co-financing strategy for mobilising identified co-financing partners.  This was the case with the Project "Paysages résilients productifs et durables dans la région de Kayes" which is scheduled to start in 2023.  From the design phase of the project, FAO has been very committed to	Excellent	Identified co-financing partners are better informed and made aware of the co-financing concept. They are committed to materialise it each year in a written form.  They will be part of the technical steering

Final evaluation of the project "Strengthening resilience to climate change through integrated agricultural and pastoral management in the Sahelian zone in the framework of Mali's Sustainable Land Management approach" - Follow-up report					11/2022
Evaluation recommendation	Management response <b>Accepted,</b> <b>Partially accepted</b> or <b>Rejected</b>	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken
The mission recommends that a study be carried out prior to the closure of the project to document co-financing bottlenecks and draw lessons for other FAO/GEF projects.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ii. identifying with these partners the respective areas of interest (location, components, activities, duration, cost, etc.);</li> <li>iii. engaging in discussions to agree on institutional arrangements with potential co-financing partners;</li> <li>iv. acquiring their support for co-financing;</li> <li>v. formalizing commitments with co-financing agreement letters;</li> <li>vi. planning and taking stock of activities, financial planning of co-financing before each committee meeting of which they will be members; and</li> <li>vii. presenting each year and in writing the commitments of co-financing in accordance with the established schedule and in relation to each component of the project.</li> </ul>	ensure that co-financing partners are reinforced in all co-financing aspects. Thus, from the Concept Note and the Project preparation grant (PPG) to the Project Document preparation, partners were regularly informed and their commitments formalized by binding letters of agreement. In addition, co-financing partners will be part of the technical steering team that will meet regularly to plan, monitor and take stock of co-financing before the Steering Committee meetings.		team of the GEF project in Kayes.
<p><b>Recommendation 6.</b> <b>To FAO, national structures (DNA, DNPIA, Mali Meteorological Agency, IER), with high importance.</b></p> <p>Consolidate project achievements such as the transformation of APFS into cooperatives and cooperative union and</p>	<b>Partially accepted</b>	The project ends on June 30. By that time, it will not be possible to design a three-month supplemental program. Furthermore, there is no funding for such a program. In addition, the coordination of the current project must tackle the closing procedures. Also, the new project will not be finalized until 2021.	Considering the enthusiasm generated by the project, many agro-pastoralist beneficiaries maintained a group dynamic after the project's closure. This led to the creation of cooperative societies in both areas covered and not covered by the	Excellent	Cooperative Societies created in such a way (APFS, VSLA) are successful models that constantly exchange on the WhatsApp network about their



Final evaluation of the project “Strengthening resilience to climate change through integrated agricultural and pastoral management in the Sahelian zone in the framework of Mali’s Sustainable Land Management approach” - Follow-up report					11/2022
Evaluation recommendation	Management response <b>Accepted,</b> <b>Partially accepted or</b> <b>Rejected</b>	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken
<p>contribute to their scaling up with the new GEF project in the Kayes region.</p> <p>The project outcomes are very satisfactory. It is important before the end of the project to design an additional three-month programme to capitalise on the achievements and contribute to their scaling up with the new GEF project in the Kayes region. Among the achievements, we can mention the transformation of APFS into cooperatives and a cooperative union. This complementary programme must also provide for the centralisation and dissemination of good agro-pastoral practices, in particular through the implementation of a small-scale programme.</p>		<p>With the support of FAO, DNA, DNPIA, IER and Mali Meteorological Agency, ESDA and any other interested structures will be asked to make proposals regarding the possibilities of transformation and scaling up of cooperatives.</p> <p>It should be noted that the transformation of FFS into Cooperatives continues actively with currently 33 Cooperative Societies and 2 Associative Societies created with the support of the networks. The WhatsApp network [created by this project] also facilitates exchanges between different communities.</p> <p>DNA and DNPIA will continue to support and monitor this process of transforming FFS into cooperatives.</p> <p>During the formulation of the new project, this question may be considered.</p>	<p>project that continue to carry out various income-generating activities. As a result, 69 associations were established:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. Niono: 49</li> <li>ii. Dioila: 02</li> <li>iii. Banamba: 07</li> <li>iv. Nara: 03</li> <li>v. Kolokani: 05</li> <li>vi. Kita: 03</li> </ul>		<p>concerns, good agro-pastoral practices. They enjoy financial autonomy that enables them to meet their own needs. These funds enable them to carry out different income-generating activities (e.g. market gardening, fattening, poultry farming, etc.) These models are currently replicated in many projects.</p>

Office of Evaluation  
E-mail: [evaluation@fao.org](mailto:evaluation@fao.org)  
Web address: [www.fao.org/evaluation](http://www.fao.org/evaluation)

**Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations**  
Rome, Italy



Some rights reserved. This work is available under a CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO licence.