

Programme Evaluation Series

**Evaluation of projects related to the
Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible
Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries
and Forests in the Context of National
Food Security funded by Germany**

Follow-up report

Evaluation of projects related to the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests in the Context of National Food Security funded by Germany - Follow-up report					02/2023
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of impact of those actions
<p>Recommendation 1.</p> <p>FAO should develop a West Africa sub-regional program on land governance and mobilize resources to fund it.</p> <p>The development of a sub-regional programme would retain and solidify the gains made in the region and overcome challenges linked to the current context of fragmented and short-term projects.</p> <p>This programme would allow land tenure expertise to be available in the region (in the sub-regional office and in the countries) to provide further support to both country and regional efforts in land governance, further cultivate partnerships at regional level and provide opportunities for new projects.</p> <p>Such a regional approach would facilitate the building of synergies with ongoing actions supported by regional organizations, such as ECOWAS, CILSS, UEMOA and OMVS.</p>	Accepted	<p>Development of a West Africa subregional programme proposal. The programme will build on results achieved in the region and strengthen existing collaboration with national partners and regional bodies, including but not limited to ECOWAS, CILSS, UEMOA, OMVS.</p> <p>The programme could focus on priority areas as identified through the Evaluation, but also emerging from ongoing consultation with FAO Regional Offices and local partners: gender, youth, conflict prevention and land degradation/desertification.</p>	<p>FAO submitted several proposals for the development of a sub/regional programme for West Africa, but no extra budgetary resources have been secured for such a programme, due to change in funding modalities from resource partners, COVID-19 and Ukraine crisis. However, resources have been secured at different scale (national) to advance some of the topics highlighted in the Evaluation:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. TCP Chad: Appui à l'élaboration de la Politique Foncière Nationale du Tchad ii. TCP Guinea (under preparation) support to the organization and implementation of the roadmap of the <i>Etats Generaux du foncier</i>. <p>In the framework of project GCP/INT/732/SPA "Water and Food Security Initiative for Africa. Mitigating the effects of Covid-19 on pastoral communities in West Africa", FAO and the <i>Réseau Billital Maroobe</i>, Antenna of Senegal (RBM-Senegal), agreed to jointly implement a number of activities for agricultural, pastoral and agropastoral communities through a letter of agreement (LOA). Within the framework of this LOA, the Senegal RBM antenna will be in charge of reviving the regional platform on responsible governance of the pastoral fund with the 9 countries previously involved.</p> <p>A new proposal was submitted to the Government of Germany, initially covering 4 countries in the regional, but due the limitations imposed by COVID-19 and the Ukraine crisis, the proposal is now limited to Sierra Leone and Mauritania. EOD 01/2023</p>	Advancing	<p>One new TCP operational and one under preparation.</p> <p>One project proposal under development.</p> <p>Land related activities in sister projects</p>

Evaluation of projects related to the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests in the Context of National Food Security funded by Germany - Follow-up report					02/2023
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of impact of those actions
<p>Recommendation 2.</p> <p>FAO should work within country-level roadmaps with specific short and long-term goals.</p> <p>Working within country specific technical roadmaps built out from existing national action plans (or assisting in their development if absent) can facilitate national ownership and greater effectiveness.</p> <p>One aspect of such roadmap work should be to conduct an analysis of the reasons why tenure insecurity exists for farmers and herders in country specific contexts.</p> <p>An M&E system should be developed to monitor progress towards achievements of set goals at national level and contributions to increased tenure security at the local level.</p>	Accepted	<p>The Land Tenure Team will ensure that all country engagements are based on an assessment of tenure insecurity and a roadmap for change that taps in strategic opportunities. The team will also prioritize selected countries to focus on achieving change at scale and in each of them will promote the identification of key reasons for tenure insecurity. Key opportunities (government programmes, donor investments, etc.) and key partnerships (govt, civil society and development agencies) will be mapped to build a road map with short- and long-term goals. M&E systems will be promoted in each of the selected countries.</p>	<p>FAO has engaged with country offices in Africa, to build a new strategy for the region, to advance the land agenda in its own work plan and better respond to country needs (series of regional and sub-regional meetings held and assessment conducted).</p> <p>At country level:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. TCP Chad: support to the national roadmap for land policy reform ii. TCP Guinea (under preparation) support to the organization and implementation of the roadmap of the <i>Etats Generaux du foncier</i>. <p>Support to the national MSP in Burkina Faso to build a national roadmap for joint implementation of the 034/2009 land law and the VGGT (LOA with <i>Confédération Paysanne du Faso</i>)</p> <p>The reactivation of the regional platform on responsible governance of the pastoral lands (project GCP/INT/732/SPA), includes the monitoring of implementation of national actions plans prepared during previous VGGT implementation projects.</p> <p>The definition of country road maps is part of the new support to Sierra Leone and Mauritania, under development.</p>	Good	<p>Country office engagement improved through new land strategy in Africa.</p> <p>FAO action driven by country roadmaps in at least four countries in the region.</p>
<p>Recommendation 3.</p> <p>FAO should continue drawing partners' attention to issues related to governance of</p>	Accepted	<p>FAO will continue to draw attention of its partners to tenure issues and to actively</p>	<p>FAO took the lead or co-lead in a series of Events and processes to maintain high visibility on land tenure and governance among which:</p>	Good	<p>Strategic synergies with partners to maintain the global land agenda in</p>

Evaluation of projects related to the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests in the Context of National Food Security funded by Germany - Follow-up report					02/2023
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of impact of those actions
<p>tenure as part of its participation in donor groups and improving coherence and coordination of efforts at the country level. Participation in donor groups should be used as an opportunity to draw partners' attention to the importance of responsible governance of tenure for food and nutrition security, conflict prevention, and gender equity; and mobilize resources for activities at country level.</p> <p>Broader coordination is also needed to ensure that approaches and messages are harmonized with regard to local communities that are the targets of implementation. The national and local platforms can play a significant role in this coordination effort. It is also important to continue developing synergies among projects implemented by different actors on land tenure in the same regions.</p>		<p>participate in donor engagement fora at global level (e.g. Global Donor Working Group on Land) and national. FAO will contribute to the development of a Global Land Tenure Report and establish a Land Observatory to provide analysis and strengthen visibility of tenure issues. FAO will engage with all partners at country level to improve convergence towards land tenure change at scale. FAO will pursue a Land Advocacy Agenda to bring land tenure to the debates in climate change, food systems, desertification, etc. As immediate action FAO will support the development of a paper on tenure and food system for the Food System Summit 2021 and will strive to reinforce collaboration with UNCCD for the implementation of the Technical guide on Tenure and Land Degradation Neutrality to be launched at UNCCD COP15.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Continued engagement with GDWGL. ii. Participation on global for a such as the Global Land Forum (May 2022) and Global Forum on Food and Agriculture (Feb 2022). iii. Promoted two events to celebrate the 10th Anniversary of the VGGT (May and October 2022). iv. Involved in the development of the so-called Framework for Action with other international partners. v. Co-lead the process for the establishment of a Global Land Observatory (GLO), together with ILC, UNHABITAT and CIRAD. <p>At country level:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Coordination of the 'Task Force' group of Partners supporting the tenure reform process in Chad. ii. Coordination of a National working group of Technical and Financial Partners working on land tenure issues in Burkina Faso. iii. TG on Tenure and LDN launched at UNCCD CoP 15 in May 2022, followed by a series of recommendation to support their implementation (see decision 27/COP15). 		<p>action strengthened and active.</p> <p>GLO under development.</p> <p>UNCCD Cop 15 decision on TG implementation. Work plan under development. Strategic partnership with UNCCD secretariat reinforced.</p>

Evaluation of projects related to the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests in the Context of National Food Security funded by Germany - Follow-up report					02/2023
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of impact of those actions
<p>Recommendation 4.</p> <p>Greater attention needs to be focused on developing concrete actions to be carried out in local communities which result in defined, precise and achievable gains. Such actions provide the opportunity to integrate fundamental components of the broader program into concrete objectives (women's land rights, dispute resolution, community empowerment, capacity development of local actors and institutions), and provide important settings for spin-offs and civil society demand to take place.</p> <p>Concrete actions in the field are those which directly and immediately affect the lives of local communities. Particular attention should be paid to: i) land mapping; ii) establishment of reliable land information systems; iii) establishment or upgrading of local courts; iv) land use and allocation plans; v) the development and implementation of land management tools; vi) capacity development of local communities on the principles of responsible investment; and vii) negotiating with investors.</p> <p>This approach could also include the establishment of synergies between the VGGT programme and other FAO projects</p>	Accepted	<p>In the selected countries including but not limited to those part of this Evaluation, FAO will pursue and strengthen actions at local level, including capacity development, community empowerment, supporting the strengthening of local land administration and build local MSPs.</p> <p>In some countries such as Mali and Mauritania, work has already started in the direction suggested by the Evaluation, with the establishment of transhumance committees under the project GCPGLO127MUL. Same is valid for the development of local platforms in Senegal (Casamance in particular) under GCPGLO347MUL.</p>	<p>Despite the limited extra budgetary resources available since the development of the management response, FAO is committed to reinforce action at local level, concrete examples are:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. Support to the establishment of local transhumance committee to mitigate potential herder/farmer conflicts in Mali and Mauritania (FMM/GLO/127). ii. Support to the Regional Transhumance committee in Zinder in Niger (LOA with ROPEN). <p>In Senegal the project "Knowing water better: towards fairer and more sustainable access to natural resources (KnoWat)" has contributed to the training of populations on local water resources governance at the local level, including youth and women. During these trainings, the need to set up or expand existing platforms to integrate local water governance issues was emphasized. FAO will support this process.</p> <p>The forthcoming German-funded project will focus on reinforcement of local Institutions as means to implementation of the new Customary Land Law.</p>	Advancing	While FAO support to countries never stopped, concrete impacts or changes following the management response to the evaluation, will require time, and more substantive resources to be invested at local level. Such resources are not yet available.

Evaluation of projects related to the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests in the Context of National Food Security funded by Germany - Follow-up report					02/2023
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of impact of those actions
implemented at the country level (such as club DIMITRA, farmer field schools and <i>Caisses de résilience</i> , projects funded by the Peace Building Fund...). This would allow the potential of the VGGT in terms of conflict prevention and equitable management of land and natural resources, to be translated into concrete results.					
<p>Recommendation 5.</p> <p>The VGGT programme should pay greater attention to all relevant production systems, as well as take into account climate change and vulnerable groups.</p> <p>There is a demand to place greater attention on all production systems and not just crop production. Depending on the country these would include forestry, fisheries, pastoralism, cross-border issues, and mining.</p> <p>Greater attention is also needed on two specific themes: i) women and youth access to land; and ii) the impact of climate change on governance of tenure.</p>	Accepted	<p>FAO will work towards the reinforcement of the centrality of land and natural resource governance for food security, poverty reduction and more broadly, inclusive rural transformation, which is central to the 2030 Development Agenda and the SDGs.</p> <p>Gender will remain at the core of any strategic intervention, becoming eventually an independent and well-defined programme. Such an effort can build on extensive experience gained in countries not part of the current Evaluation, such as Kenya and Colombia.</p> <p>FAO will further mainstream VGGT principles in key areas of work that are responding to the</p>	<p>As follow up to the Decision 27/ COP15 of UNCCD FAO and UNCCD secretariat are working together on the development of a joint workplan aimed at mainstreaming VGGT principles in LDN initiatives.</p> <p>LTT is increasing its collaboration with GEF and GCF formulation projects.</p> <p>FAO (ESP and CFI) in collaboration with Global Land Alliance are working on a study on the linkages between collective tenure and Climate change mitigation in Arica, including recommendations for investments.</p> <p>The principles of the VGGT have been used to mainstream the “tenure” concept related to water resources. This allows a better linkage to sustainable food systems and mitigation of climate change strategies. Water tenure is taken up by civil society, for example in the Fair Water Footprints initiative initiated by Water Witness, and the MSP in Senegal.</p> <p>COAG 28th session, discussed the Governance of Water Resources Tenure for Food and Agriculture,</p>	Advancing	<p>New initiatives related to tenure a climate change nexus started.</p> <p>Water tenure assessment framework developed (through German funded project), and great attention towards water tenure achieved.</p>

Evaluation of projects related to the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests in the Context of National Food Security funded by Germany - Follow-up report					02/2023
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of impact of those actions
		<p>current context, such as FAO's work on climate change, natural resources conservation, water management, landscape management.</p> <p>The thematic area of youth is already defined among the priority areas of work for the LTT in 2021/2024.</p>	giving FAO a mandate to initiate a "Global Dialogue on Water Tenure".		
<p>Recommendation 6.</p> <p>While the platforms have demonstrated great utility in coordination and dialog development, they remain fragile especially at local level. FAO should work to develop partners' capacities to ensure sustainability of platforms.</p> <p>Given platforms' success and central position in the project, greater attention should be given to their sustainability in particular in the case of local platforms.</p> <p>Platforms need to be opened up to all relevant stakeholders, including the private sector which has been absent in most cases. There is a need to develop a specific approach towards the private sector. Operating rules should be formalized according to local realities. And the dominance of platforms by a particular actor or sector, should be mitigated.</p>	Accepted	<p>The sustainability and support of MSP is and remains at the core of the LTT programme priorities and will be one of the fundamental pillars and principle of implementation for any in country intervention, in the respect of local context. In the immediate terms the LTT has already adopted a strategy of synergy and coordination with partner organization such as ILC and WHH to ensure support to MSP.</p>	<p>In Sierra Leone, the VGGT Technical Working Group (MSP), continued its activities (after the project closure) and played a key role in the development and final enacted by Parliament of two land related laws. The TWG is also directly consulted in the formulation and possible implementation of the WB funded Land Administration Programme, and forthcoming FAO implemented new land project (2023), through which local MSP will play a role in monitoring.</p> <p>FAO supported, in coordination with other Partners (ILC, Welthunger Hilfe and GIZ) the national MSP in Burkina Faso to build a national roadmap for joint implementation of the 034/2009 land law and the VGGT.</p> <p>Support to the strengthening of local multi-stakeholder platforms on tenure governance in Mauritania (Boghe et Gorgol) and in Mali (Kayes and Segou). (FMM/GLO/127).</p>	Good	<p>More systematic assessment of MSP impact conducted, also through collective efforts with FAO partners (particularly in the framework of VGGT 10th Anniversary).</p> <p>Expansion of MSP to local level.</p>

Evaluation of projects related to the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests in the Context of National Food Security funded by Germany - Follow-up report					02/2023
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of impact of those actions
Exchanges between platforms (at both local and national level) should be continued as a way to further share experiences and develop capacities.			<p>In Senegal the Knowat project related to water benefit from the national and local MSP for the training and the water tenure assessment and the local consultations.</p> <p>The national MSP have requested FAO to support in their will of having a more holistic approach to integrate other actors related to water and soil, water and climate change. Thanks to the Knowat project the Ministry of Water and sanitation and its technical services has started discussions with the national MSP.</p> <p>FAO supported Senegalese MSP steering committee to participate in the formulation of the national cadastre project financed by the World Bank.</p> <p>FAO is partnering with ILC, WHH, IFAD and WB in a so-called Convergence group, where experiences and progress from MSP in countries are shared, especially where more than one partner is providing support.</p>		
<p>Recommendation 7.</p> <p>There is a need to continue to provide support to legal and institutional capacity development (in particularly in Mali and Liberia where new laws have been adopted) and continue efforts for the adoption of the Pastoralist Law in Mongolia.</p> <p>Countries which have adopted new laws continue to need assistance in the implementation of these laws as part of their land policy reform process. Additional legal assistance is needed in the development of implementing regulations, enforcement,</p>	Accepted	The recommendation is in line with programme priorities of the LTT for 2021–2024. In particular, with the objective of strengthening innovative local approaches for advancing governance of tenure by developing capacities and promoting multi-stakeholder platforms at local level to improve tenure rights through implementation of land policies	<p>FAO continues to provide technical (in particular legal) support throughout the process that led to the final enactment by Parliament of Customary Land Act and Land Commission Act in August 2022. Institutional support (particularly at local level) is the focus of a forthcoming intervention in the country from 2023, as necessary step towards the implementation of the new acts.</p> <p>Support to the strengthening of local transhumance committed in Mali and Mauritania helped to build institutional capacities of these mechanisms to prevent, mitigate and resolve transhumance related conflicts. Forthcoming activities in Mauritania (through the</p>	Advancing	<p>Two new land related laws in Sierra Leone.</p> <p>No further support to Liberia no Mali beyond 2022.</p>

Evaluation of projects related to the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests in the Context of National Food Security funded by Germany - Follow-up report					02/2023
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of impact of those actions
<p>awareness raising about new laws, legal assistance to local communities and training of local officials.</p> <p>Also needed in all countries is support for strengthening or establishing institutions at local and national level (courts, land tenure commissions etc.) to improve access of community members, associations and villages to the means to exercise their rights.</p> <p>Collaborations with universities could be further promoted in view of developing curricula on responsible governance of tenure (including reviewing existing courses on governance of tenure to integrate the VGGT), so as to contribute to legal and institutional capacity development.</p> <p>Awareness raising of actors on responsible governance of tenure should be continued to include representatives of political parties and groups.</p>		<p>and through improved customary systems.</p> <p>The LTT will focus on promoting tenure policy reforms (including land reform, land administration improvement and land consolidation programs) that will scale up equitable rural transformation and increase tenure rights by small-scale producers in selected countries with greater needs/opportunities.</p> <p>The capacity to further support the process of pastoral law development in Mongolia will depend on fund mobilization.</p>	<p>German project) will further contribute to strengthen these local mechanisms.</p> <p>FMM/GLO/127 supported the first National Land Conference in Liberia, but no further support is currently envisaged from FAO through extra budgetary allocation. This is partially justified by an extensive support to the land sector by multiple partners in the countries which give FAO a less evident comparative advantage.</p> <p>FAO collaborated, through a LOA with <i>Paysanne du Faso</i> (CPF), with a series of national and international partners (GRAF, Welthunger Hilfe, ILC, GIZ) to prepare an illustrated guide on the implementation of the 034/2009 land law and the VGGT in Burkina Faso. The guide was used by FAO and partners as a joint initiative and joint approach to sensitize local stakeholders on the use of the land law and the VGGT: https://www.fao.org/documents/card/fr/c/cc0962fr.</p>		
<p>Recommendation 8.</p> <p>FAO should move ownership of the VGGT out of the FAO domain, so that it is seen as an international agreement, and not necessarily FAO-owned. It should also place the VGGT in a supporting role instead of a leading role within country land policy reform processes.</p>	Accepted	<p>FAO will pay greater attention in communicating the VGGT as CFS product, through the development of communication and CD material, delivery of programmes, and interaction with international and national partners. Fundamental in this</p>	<p>FAO and CFS co-organized a series of events for the VGGT 10th Anniversary during which the VGGT were clearly featured as CFS product, although many partners still refer to FAO as main technical implementing agency.</p> <p>FAO is also working with CFS Secretariat to improve the accountability mechanism of the VGGT, particularly.</p>	Advancing	N/A

Evaluation of projects related to the Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests in the Context of National Food Security funded by Germany - Follow-up report					02/2023
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Description of impact of those actions
<p>Rethinking how the VGGT and related projects are communicated could contribute to increased ownership by the various actors intervening in land governance, synergies and coherence of actions, and decrease donor competition over land rights efforts.</p> <p>The efforts of communicating the VGGT should continue extending to other countries.</p>		regard will be the continuous engagement of CFS, its board and Secretariat, to maintain the VGGT as highest priority in CFS agenda.			
<p>Recommendation 9.</p> <p>Greater attention should be placed on including the private sector in the VGGT programme goals, objectives and activities so as to secure business investment alongside community tenure security.</p> <p>Emphasis on community - investor interaction and consultation, and the formation of mutually beneficial economic arrangements would greatly enhance the role of investments in development.</p> <p>There is a need to develop specific methods and approaches to involve the private sector in policy dialogue on governance of tenure and other VGGT activities and programmes.</p>	Accepted	FAO will continue to produce guidance for private sector on VGGT principles. On developing roadmap for changes (as per recommendation 2) FAO will emphasize the importance of community-investor interaction and consultation and awareness raising about responsible investments. FAO will assess what methods were successful on promoting private sector engagement on policy dialogues on governance of tenure and disseminate such learnings.	<p>The newly established multi-stakeholder committee in charge of preparing the land policy in Chad includes Private sector as a stakeholder group.</p> <p>FAO contributed through the 'Land collaborative initiative' to the preparation of a learning cycle focusing on the engagement with Private Sector on Responsible Agricultural Investments (RAI), which combined a diversity of approaches and resulted in the development of a number of tools to explore engagement with business actors.</p> <p>Through the Hand-in-Hand Initiative, FAO is supporting the government of Ethiopia to improve the land tenure arrangements of the smallholder farmers and investors around the Agro-Commodity Procurement Zones (ACPZ). A set of recommendations that are bold yet realistic for land governance in these areas will be submitted before the end of 2022.</p>	Advancing	N/A

Office of Evaluation
E-mail: evaluation@fao.org
Web address: www.fao.org/evaluation

Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
Rome, Italy



Some rights reserved. This work is available under a CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO licence.