

Pesticide residues in food 2009

Joint FAO/WHO Meeting
on Pesticide Residues

FAO
PLANT
PRODUCTION
AND PROTECTION
PAPER

196

REPORT 2009



World Health
Organization



Food and Agriculture
Organization of
the United Nations

Pesticide residues in food 2009

Joint FAO/WHO Meeting
on Pesticide Residues

FAO
PLANT
PRODUCTION
AND PROTECTION
PAPER

196

Report of the Joint Meeting of the FAO Panel of Experts on
Pesticide Residues in Food and the Environment and the
WHO Core Assessment Group on Pesticide Residues
Geneva, Switzerland, 16–25 September 2009

The designations employed and the presentation of material in this information product do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) concerning the legal or development status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The mention of specific companies or products of manufacturers, whether or not these have been patented, does not imply that these have been endorsed or recommended by FAO in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned.

ISBN 978-92-5-106452-8

All rights reserved. Reproduction and dissemination of material in this information product for educational or other non-commercial purposes are authorized without any prior written permission from the copyright holders provided the source is fully acknowledged. Reproduction of material in this information product for resale or other commercial purposes is prohibited without written permission of the copyright holders. Applications for such permission should be addressed to:

Chief

Electronic Publishing Policy and Support Branch
Communication Division

FAO

Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy

or by e-mail to:

copyright@fao.org

CONTENTS

List of participants	iii
Abbreviations	vii
Use of JMPR reports and evaluations by registration authorities	xi
REPORT OF THE 2009 JOINT FAO/WHO MEETING OF EXPERTS	1
1. Introduction	1
1.1 Declaration of interests	2
2. General considerations	3
2.1 Transparency in THE Maximum residue level estimation process: further considerations	3
2.2 The OECD guidance document on livestock feeding	5
2.3 Guidance for data submission for estimation of residue levels in/on spices	7
2.4 Update of the fao manual on the submission and evaluation of Data on pesticide residues for the estimation of maximum residue levels in food and feed	8
3. Responses to specific concerns raised by the Codex Committee on Pesticide Residues (CCPR)	11
3.1 Boscalid (221)	11
3.2 Carbofuran (096).....	12
3.3 Chlorantraniliprole (230)	14
3.4 Cyfluthrin (157)/beta-cyfluthrin (228) – alternative GAP	16
3.5 Fenthion (39).....	17
3.6 Methomyl (094).....	18
3.7 Phorate (112).....	19
3.8 Procymidone (136).....	22
3.9 Spirotetramat (234)	24
3.10 Triadimefon (133) and Triadimenol (168).....	25
4. Dietary risk assessment	27
5. Evaluation of data for acceptable daily intake and acute dietary intake for humans, maximum residue levels and supervised trial median residue values	31
5.1 Benalaxyl (155) (R) **	31
5.2 Bifenthrin (178) (T) **	41
5.3 Boscalid (221) (R).....	49
5.4 Buprofezin (173) (R).....	69
5.5 Cadusafos (174) (T)**	77
5.6 Carbofuran (096) (R).....	83
5.7 Chlorothalonil (081) (T)**.....	89
5.8 Chlorpyrifos-methyl (090) (R) **	99

5.9	Cycloxydim (179) (T) **	125
5.10	Cypermethrin (118) (R)	131
5.11	Fenbuconazole (197) (R)	135
5.12	Fluopicolide (235) (T, R)*	141
5.13	Haloxypop (194) and haloxypop-P (R)**	165
5.14	Hexythiazox (176) (R)**	193
5.15	Indoxacarb (216) (R)	209
5.16	Metaflumizone (236) (T, R)*	217
5.17	Methoxyfenozide (209) (R)	239
5.18	Paraquat (057) (R)	247
5.19	Prochloraz (142) (R)	249
5.20	Prothioconazole (232) (R)	251
5.21	Spirodiclofen (237) (T, R)*	261
5.22	Zoxamide (227) (R)	287
	Recommendations	289
	Future work	291
	Annex 1: Acceptable daily intakes, short-term dietary intakes, acute reference doses, recommended maximum residue limits and supervised trials median residue values recorded by the 2009 Meeting	293
	Annex 2: Index of reports and evaluations of pesticides by the JMPR	307
	Annex 3: International estimated daily intakes of pesticide residues	319
	Annex 4: International estimates of short-term dietary intakes of pesticide residues	365
	Annex 5: Reports and other documents resulting from previous Joint Meetings of the FAO Panel of Experts on Pesticide Residues in Food and the Environment and the WHO Expert Groups on Pesticide Residues	393
	Annex 6: Livestock dietary burden	401
	FAO Technical papers	425
	Corrigenda – Corrections to the Report of the 2008 Meeting	429

D, dietary risk assessment; R, residue and analytical aspects; T, toxicological evaluation.

* New compound

** Evaluated within the periodic review programme of the Code Committee on Pesticide Residues

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

2009 JOINT FAO/WHO MEETING ON PESTICIDE RESIDUES

GENEVA, 16–25 SEPTEMBER 2009

FAO Members

Dr Ursula Banasiak, Federal Institute for Risk Assessment, Thielallee 88-92, D-14195 Berlin, Germany

Professor Eloisa Dutra Caldas, University of Brasilia, College of Health Sciences, Pharmaceutical Sciences Department, Campus Universitário Darci Ribeiro, 70919-970 Brasília/DF, Brazil

Mr Stephen Funk, Health Effects Division (7509P), United States Environmental Protection Agency, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington DC 20460, USA

Mr Denis J. Hamilton, Principal Scientific Officer Biosecurity, Department of Primary Industries and Fisheries, PO Box 46, Brisbane, QLD 4001, Australia

Mr David Lunn, Senior Programme Manager (Residues–Plants), Export Standards Group, New Zealand Food Safety Authority, PO Box 2835, Wellington, New Zealand (*FAO Rapporteur*)

Dr Dougal MacLachlan, Australian Quarantine and Inspection Service, Australian Government Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry, GPO Box 858, Canberra, ACT 2601, Australia

Dr Bernadette Ossendorp, Centre for Substances and Integrated Risk Assessment, National Institute of Public Health and the Environment (RIVM), Antonie van Leeuwenhoeklaan 9, PO Box 1, 3720 BA Bilthoven, Netherlands (*FAO Chairman*)

Dr Yukiko Yamada, Deputy Director-General, Food Safety and Consumer Affairs Bureau, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, 1-2-1 Kasumigaseki, Chiyoda-ku, Tokyo 100-8950, Japan

WHO Members

Professor Alan R. Boobis, Experimental Medicine & Toxicology, Division of Investigative Science, Faculty of Medicine, Imperial College London, Hammersmith Campus, Ducane Road, London W12 0NN, England

Dr Vicki L. Dellarco, Office of Pesticide Programs (7501P), United States Environmental Protection Agency, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20460, USA (WHO Rapporteur)

Dr Helen Hakansson, Institute of Environmental Medicine, Karolinska Institutet, Unit of Environmental Health Risk Assessment, Box 210, Nobelsväg 13, S-171 77 Stockholm, Sweden

Professor Angelo Moretto, Department of Environmental and Occupational Health, University of Milan, International Centre for Pesticides and Health Risk Prevention, Luigi Sacco Hospital, Via Stephenson 94, 20157 Milan, Italy (WHO Chairman)

Dr Roland Solecki, Chemical Safety Division, Steering of Procedures and Overall Assessment, Federal Institute for Risk Assessment, Thielallee 88-92, D-14195 Berlin, Germany

Dr Maria Tasheva, Consultant, National Service for Plant Protection, Ministry of Agriculture and Food, 17 Hristo Botev Bul. 1040 Sofia, Bulgaria

Secretariat

Dr habil. Árpád Ambrus, Hungarian Food Safety Office, Gyali ut 2-6, 1097 Budapest, Hungary (FAO Temporary Adviser)

Mr Kevin Bodnaruk, 26/12 Phillip Mall, West Pymble, NSW 2073, Australia (FAO Editor)

Dr Katie Calp, Pest Management Regulatory Agency, Health Canada, 2720 Riverside Drive, AL 6605E Ottawa, Canada (WHO Temporary Adviser)

Ms Gracia Brisco, Food Standards Officer, Joint FAO/WHO Food Standards Programme, Nutrition and Consumer Protection Division, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Viale delle terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy (Codex Secretariat)

Dr Ian Dewhurst, Chemicals Regulation Directorate, Mallard House, King's Pool, 3 Peasholme Green, York YO1 7PX, England (WHO Temporary Adviser)

Dr William Donovan, United States Environmental Protection Agency, MC 7509C, Washington, DC 20460, USA (FAO Temporary Adviser)

Mr Makoto Irie, Plant Product Safety Division, Food Safety and Consumer Affairs Bureau, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, 1-2-1 Kasumigaseki, Chiyoda-ku, Tokyo 100-8950, Japan (FAO Temporary Adviser)

Dr Debabrata Kanungo, Additional DG, Directorate General of Health Services, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, West, Block No. 1, R.K. Puram, New Delhi, India (WHO Temporary Adviser)

Dr Katerina Mastovska, Eastern Regional Research Center (ERRC), Agricultural Research Service (ARS), United States Department of Agriculture, 600 E. Mermaid Lane, Wyndmoor, PA 19038, USA (FAO Temporary Adviser)

Dr Jeronimas Maskeliunas, Food Standards Officer, Joint FAO/WHO Food Standards Programme, Nutrition and Consumer Protection Division, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Viale delle terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy (Codex Secretariat)

Dr Heidi Mattock, 21 bis rue du Mont Ouest, 38230 Tignieu-Jamezieu, France (WHO Editor)

Dr Douglas B. McGregor, Toxicity Evaluation Consultants, 38 Shore Road, Aberdour KY3 0TU, Scotland (WHO Temporary Adviser)

Dr Rudolf Pfeil, Toxicology of Pesticides and Biocides, Federal Institute for Risk Assessment, Thielallee 88-92, D-14195 Berlin, Germany (WHO Temporary Adviser)

Dr Xiongwu Qiao, Shanxi Academy of Agricultural Sciences, 2 Changfeng Street, Taiyuan, Shanxi 030006, China (FAO Temporary Adviser)

Ms Jeannie Richards, 15 bis rue Georges Musy, 71100 Saint Remy, France (FAO Temporary Adviser)

Dr Prakashchandra V. Shah, United States Environmental Protection Agency, Mail Stop: 7505P, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington DC 20460, USA (WHO Temporary Adviser)

Mr Christian Sieke, Federal Institute for Risk Assessment, Thielallee 88-92, D-14195 Berlin, Germany (FAO Temporary Adviser)

Dr Angelika Tritscher, Food Safety and Zoonoses (FOS), International Programme on Chemical Safety, World Health Organization, 1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland (WHO Joint Secretary)

Ms Trijntje van der Velde, National Institute of Public Health and the Environment (RIVM), Antonie van Leeuwenhoeklaan 9, PO Box 1, 3720 BA Bilthoven, Netherlands (FAO Temporary Adviser)

Dr Gerrit Wolterink, Centre for Substances & Integrated Risk Assessment, National Institute of Public Health and the Environment (RIVM), Antonie van Leeuwenhoeklaan 9, PO Box 1, 3720 BA Bilthoven, Netherlands (WHO Temporary Adviser)

Ms Yong Zhen Yang, Plant Protection Service (AGPP), Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy (FAO Joint Secretary)

Dr Midori Yoshida, Section Chief, Division of Pathology, Biological Safety Research Center, National Institute of Health Sciences, Ministry of Health, Labor and Welfare, 1-18-1 Kamiyoga, Setagaya-ku, Tokyo 158-8501, Japan (WHO Temporary Adviser)

Dr Jürg Zarn, Swiss Federal Office of Public Health, Nutritional and Toxicological Risks Section, Stauffacherstrasse 101, CH-8004 Zurich, Switzerland (WHO Temporary Adviser)

ABBREVIATIONS

ADI	acceptable daily intake
ai	active ingredient
ALP	alkaline phosphatase
ALT	alanine aminotransferase
ARfD	acute reference dose
AST	aspartate aminotransferase
AUC	area under the curve for concentration–time
BMDL ₁₀	benchmark-dose lower 95% confidence level
BROD	benzyloxyresorufin <i>O</i> -de-ethylase
bw	body weight
CAR	constitutive androstane receptor
CAS	Chemical Abstracts Service
CCFAC	Codex Committee on Food Additives and Contaminants
CCN	Codex classification number (for compounds or commodities)
CCPR	Codex Committee on Pesticide Residues
C _{max}	maximum concentration
CXL	Codex MRL
DT ₅₀	time taken for 50% of the concentration to dissipate
EC ₅₀	the concentration of agonist that elicits a response that is 50% of the possible maximum
EROD	ethoxyresorufin <i>O</i> -deethylase
F ₀	parental generation
F ₁	first filial generation
F ₂	second filial generation
FAO	Food and Agricultural Organization of the United Nations
FOB	functional observational battery
GAP	good agricultural practice
GC	gas chromatography
GC-FPD	gas chromatography with flame photometric detection
GGT	gamma-glutamyltransferase
GEMS/Food	Global Environment Monitoring System–Food Contamination Monitoring and Assessment Programme

HR	highest residue in the edible portion of a commodity found in trials used to estimate a maximum residue level in the commodity
HR-P	highest residue in a processed commodity calculated by multiplying the HR of the raw commodity by the corresponding processing factor
IC ₅₀	concentration required to inhibit activity by 50%
IEDI	international estimated daily intake
IESTI	international estimate of short-term dietary intake
ISO	International Organization for Standardization
IUPAC	International Union of Pure and Applied Chemistry
JECFA	Joint Expert Committee on Food Additives
JMPR	Joint Meeting on Pesticide Residues
JMPS	Joint FAO/WHO Meeting on Pesticide Specifications
LC	liquid chromatography
LC ₅₀	median lethal concentration
LD ₅₀	median lethal dose
LOAEL	lowest-observed-adverse-effect level
LOAEC	lowest-observed-adverse-effect concentration
LOD	limit of detection
LOQ	limit of quantification
MCH	mean corpuscular haemoglobin
MCV	mean corpuscular volume
MEQ	methylethoxyquin
MLE	maximum likelihood estimation
MRL	maximum residue limit
MS	mass spectrometry
MS/MS	tandem mass spectrometry
NOAEL	no-observed-adverse-effect level
NTE	neuropathy target esterase
OECD	Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development
PPAR α	peroxisome proliferator-induced receptor alpha
PHI	pre-harvest interval
ppm	parts per million
PROD	pentylresorufin <i>O</i> -dealkylase
STMR	supervised trials median residue
STMR-P	supervised trials median residue in a processed commodity calculated by multiplying the STMR of the raw commodity by the corresponding processing factor
T3	triiodothyronine

T4	thyroxine
TRR	total radiolabelled residue
TSH	thyroid stimulating hormone
TMDI	theoretical maximum daily intake
UCL	upper confidence limit
WHO	World Health Organization

USE OF JMPR REPORTS AND EVALUATIONS BY REGISTRATION AUTHORITIES

Most of the summaries and evaluations contained in this report are based on unpublished proprietary data submitted for use by JMPR in making its assessments. A registration authority should not grant a registration on the basis of an evaluation unless it has first received authorization for such use from the owner of the data submitted for the JMPR review or has received the data on which the summaries are based, either from the owner of the data or from a second party that has obtained permission from the owner of the data for this purpose.