

PROJECT EVALUATION SERIES

**Mid-term evaluation of “Securing
Biodiversity Conservation and
Sustainable Use in China's Dongting
Lake Protected Areas”**

**GCP/CPR/043/GFF
GEF ID: 4356**

ANNEXES

**FOOD AND AGRICULTURE ORGANIZATION OF THE UNITED NATIONS
Rome, 2019**

Contents

1	Annex 1. GEF Rating scheme	1
2	Annex 2. Log Frame Review	3
3	Annex 3. List of MTE questions	33
4	Annex 4. Project architecture	34

1 Annex 1. GEF Rating scheme

Overall Outcome ratings

MTEs should use mid-term targets as given in the project’s log frame to assess delivery of outcomes. If no mid-term indicator targets are available then the MTE should base outcome ratings on assessment of delivery of results to date, work plans.

Rating	Description
Highly Satisfactory (HS)	“Level of outcomes achieved clearly exceeds expectations and/or there were no short comings.”
Satisfactory (S)	“Level of outcomes achieved was as expected and/or there were no or minor short comings.”
Moderately Satisfactory (MS)	“Level of outcomes achieved more or less as expected and/or there were moderate short comings.”
Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU)	“Level of outcomes achieved somewhat lower than expected and/or there were significant shortcomings.”
Unsatisfactory (U)	“Level of outcomes achieved substantially lower than expected and/or there were major short comings.”
Highly Unsatisfactory (HU)	“Only a negligible level of outcomes achieved and/or there were severe short comings.”
Unable to Assess (UA)	The available information does not allow an assessment of the level of outcome achievements.

Factors affecting performance (assess each element separately, M&E is treated differently – see below)

Rating	Description
Highly Satisfactory (HS)	There were no shortcomings and quality of design and readiness/project implementation/project execution/co-financing/partnerships and stakeholder involvement/communication and knowledge management exceeded expectations.
Satisfactory (S)	There were no or minor shortcomings and quality of design and readiness/project implementation/project execution/co-financing/partnerships and stakeholder involvement/communication and knowledge management meets expectations.
Moderately Satisfactory (MS)	There were some shortcomings and quality of design and readiness/project implementation/project execution/co-financing/partnerships and stakeholder involvement/communication and knowledge management more or less meets expectations.
Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU)	There were significant shortcomings and quality of design and readiness/project implementation/project execution/co-financing/partnerships and stakeholder involvement/communication and knowledge management somewhat lower than expected.
Unsatisfactory (U)	There were major shortcomings and quality of implementation substantially lower than expected.
Highly Unsatisfactory (HU)	There were severe shortcomings in quality of design and readiness/project implementation/project execution/co-financing/partnerships and stakeholder involvement/communication and knowledge management .
Unable to Assess (UA)	The available information does not allow an assessment of the quality of design and readiness/project implementation/project execution/co-

	<i>financing/partnerships and stakeholder involvement/communication and knowledge management.</i>
--	--

Monitoring and Evaluation Design or Implementation Ratings (Overall M&E design, Design and Implementation assessed separately)

Rating	Description
<i>Highly Satisfactory (HS)</i>	<i>There were no shortcomings and quality of M&E design or M&E implementation exceeded expectations.</i>
<i>Satisfactory (S)</i>	<i>There were no or minor shortcomings and quality of M&E design or M&E implementation meets expectations.</i>
<i>Moderately Satisfactory (MS)</i>	<i>There were some shortcomings and quality of M&E design or M&E implementation more or less meets expectations.</i>
<i>Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU)</i>	<i>There were significant shortcomings and quality of M&E design or M&E implementation somewhat lower than expected.</i>
<i>Unsatisfactory (U)</i>	<i>There were major shortcomings and quality of M&E design or M&E implementation substantially lower than expected.</i>
<i>Highly Unsatisfactory (HU)</i>	<i>There were severe shortcomings in M&E design or M&E implementation.</i>
<i>Unable to Assess (UA)</i>	<i>The available information does not allow an assessment of the quality of M&E design or M&E implementation</i>

Sustainability

Rating	Description
<i>Likely (L)</i>	<i>There is little or no risk to sustainability.</i>
<i>Moderately Likely (ML)</i>	<i>There are moderate risks to sustainability.</i>
<i>Moderately Unlikely (MU)</i>	<i>There are significant risks to sustainability.</i>
<i>Unlikely (U)</i>	<i>There are severe risks to sustainability.</i>
<i>Unable to Assess (UA)</i>	<i>Unable to assess the expected incidence and magnitude of risks to sustainability.</i>

2 Annex 2. Logframe review

Table 1a. Progress Evaluation towards Results Matrix *

(Notes: No mid-term targets were set in ProDoc; HS for the above 60% of the achieved indicator, S for 40-60%, and MS for below 40%)

Project Strategy	Indicator	Baseline Level	End-of-project Target	Midterm Level & Assessment	Achievement Rating
<p>Objective: To secure the conservation of biodiversity of global importance in the Dongting Lake through strengthening existing management efforts and</p>	<p>DLCC (replaced by Multi Sectoral Government Meeting (MSGM)) is fulfilling its function of coordinating the implementation of the DWEMP and at least two key biodiversity threats are addressed (sand mining threatening porpoises, poplar plantations, and/or</p>	<p>A circular creating the Dongting Lake Conservation Committee (DLCC) and appointing the chairman and members was issued by the provincial government in 2007. However, the committee is still not operating, the sectors are not sharing existing monitoring data and analysis weakening sound decision making,</p>	<p>Threats will be all addressed, but the healthy conditions of DWE will be closely dependent on the fulfillment of following outputs and outcomes.</p>	<p>45% Multi-sectoral and multi-level governmental Dongting Wetland Protection Joint Action Plan were developed and implemented by assigning the tasks to all the governmental agencies in the province through provincial conference for all level governments include provincial, city, county, town and village (as later illustrated of the actions of Nov. 1, 2017, Dec. 29, 2017 and Feb. 2018). As a result, Sand mining, illegal fishing and water pollution threatening porpoises were seriously concerned and addressed. The protection of ecological environment of Dongting Lake was fully strengthened and reinforced through series comprehensive improvement action plans, including: the</p>	<p>S</p>

Outcome 1:	Indicator 1: DLCC is fulfilling its function of coordinating the implementation of the DWEMP and at least two key biodiversity threats are addressed (sand mining threatening porpoises, poplar plantations, and/or un-sustainable	No issue addressed by the DLCC	National and local policies are good, but there will be strong needs to considering the follow up actions on how the wetland will be kept healthier after policies executed.	55% After DLCC replaced by the PMSGM, a series of new planning and actions were carried out on Dongting Wetland Ecosystem Conservation since December 2017. Until June 2018, Sand mining, illegal fishing and water pollution threatening porpoises were seriously concerned and almost all the threats were eliminated from the core areas of the Nature Reserves in Dongting Lake. As the results of provincial department operation and special actions, the following threats within Dongting Lake were removed: (1) 5300 ha of poplar trees in the core areas of nature	S
Outcome 2:	Indicator 2.1.a: Improvement in management effectiveness of NRs by the end of the project monitored through the BD management	Management effectiveness assessment scores: East DL 61; West DL 54; South DL 56; and Hengling 53 Threat score: East DL 56; West DL 63; South DL 57; and Hengling 61	(a) NR management effectiveness assessment improved for: East Dongting Lake (DL) from 61 to 70; West DL from 54 to 70; South DL from 56 to 68; and Hengling from 53 to 66;	75% The tracking processes were carried out in June 4-10, 2019. There are clear progresses on NR management effectiveness and decrease of threats score. (a) Management efficiency score results: East DT 78; West DT 66; South DT 68; Hengling NR 57. (b) Threats Score: East DT 36; West DT 25; South DT 29; Hengling NR 12	HS
	Indicator 2.1.b : 50% increase in national and local governmental budget allocations to PA	USD 20 million/year	USD 30 million/year	26% Investigation data shows an increase on both national/local fund for NR and the NRs that the operation and project budget (in USD) are as follows: East DT 312,295/1,656,334; West DT 101,541/4,173,371; South DT 281,118/312,354;	MS

	<p>Indicator 2.2.a : Improved biodiversity and endangered species indicators by the end of the project in DWE: (i) increase in total bird visitation by 10% in the four DL NRs; (ii) finless porpoise population maintained; (iii) lesser white-fronted goose population maintained; (iv) black stork population maintained; (v) 5% increase in Pere Davis deer population; (vi) Whistling Swan population maintained; (vii) increase from 2 to 5%</p>	<p>(i) Total migratory bird visitation 104,000-130,000 (2008-2012); (ii) Finless porpoise: 100-150 in DWE (2011), ca. 800 total population; (iii) Lesser white-fronted goose (<i>Anser erythropus</i>): 18,000 in DWE (mostly in East DL NR) which is 50% of total global population; (iv) Black stork (<i>ciconia nigra</i>): 23 in DWE (December 2011), 24,000-34,000 East Asia population; (v) Pere David's Deer (<i>Elaphurus Davidianus</i>): 25 in DWE (Jan 2012), 3,000 global population; (vi) Whistling Swan (<i>Cygnus columbianus</i>): 800-1,000</p>	<p>(i) Total migratory bird visitation 115,000-143,000; (ii) Finless porpoise: 100-150 in DWE; (iii) Lesser white-fronted goose: 18,000 in DWE, which is 50% of total global population; (iv) Black stork: 23 in DWE; (v) Pere David's Deer: 26 in DWE; (vi) Whistling Swan: 800-1,000 in DWE; (vii) Silver fish 5% appearance rate in monitoring catches in DWE</p>	<p>70%</p> <p>Key conservation actions for flag species: East Dongting NR together other NRs completed the synchronized monitoring of wintering birds from November 2017 to March 2018</p> <p>The East Dongting Lake and the Hengling lake, the South Dongting Lake and the West Dongting Lake jointly carried out the investigation on the Milu population from January to June of 2018, and completed the investigation of the finless porpoise in March 2018.</p> <p>After Milu wild releasing these years, a series of policies on protection and compensation of Milu related crop damaging were executed in the main habitats, the total population is increased to 187 in Dongting Lake wetland.</p> <p>The black stork conservation association in West Dongting NR running well, and more than 50 black storks were observed in the winter of 2018.</p> <p>Tracking Tool results of 2017-2018: (i) total wintering birds 226352 (53 species);(ii) The synchronized investigation of finless Porpoise in central Yangtze main river and Dongting, Poyang Lake showed the total number of porpoise in Dongting Lake increased a little</p>	HS
--	--	--	--	---	----

	<p>Indicator 2.2.b : Improved income for households (of which 60% are represented by women as the main participant and beneficiary) involved in co-management demonstration models: (i) 320 farming households have increased their income by at least 30% from East DL NR from bird-friendly rice production; (ii) 400 house-holds involved in organic fish farming and 500 households involved in rights-based fisheries co-management to</p>	<p>2.2.b (i) Income baseline to be established in PY1</p>	<p>The gross income of fisherman can surely 100% increase within 5 years, but the problem of inflation is not certain as considering the net income increase.</p>	<p>25% (1) East Dongting NR: The plan for the sustainable development of the Caisang lake has been completed, and the joint development agreement is being negotiated with the community. The agricultural insurance for wildlife damage to crops was jointly implemented with Junshan District Government, the total input for compensations were USD 46,000 and 92,000 in 2016 and 2017 respectively. (2) West Dongting NR: Two Eco tourist company signed agreements with NR for a formalized management of tourism in the area. The West Dongting NR has implemented the wetland ecological benefits compensation project since 2017 in 11 villages and towns within the 1 km range of the NR. The project was divided into four categories include: Direct compensation on crop damage; Awarding on good practices; Compensation on damaging of exiting infrastructures and Compensation on restoration habitats from poplar tree area and hydraulic recreations. The total investment was USD 4.9 million. In Qingshan polder in West Dongting NR, the organic fishery was developed, and the co-management administrative measures of Qingshan Polder were formulated</p>	<p>MS</p>
--	---	---	---	---	-----------

Outcome 3:	Indicator 3.1a : BD O2 tracking tool score on biodiversity conservation integration in policies and regulations increased from 17 to 23 (out of 36 possible) for the sectors influencing on DWE	17 (out of 36)	23 (out of 36)	<p>100%</p> <p>The tracking processes were carried out by PMO in July 5, 2018 through investigation on Governmental sector policies and documents. There are clearly progresses towards the outcomes as follows:</p> <p>The overall score evaluated is 31 comparing with the results of 17 in 2011.</p> <p>Amendment of Wetland Protection Regulation of Hunan Province:</p> <p>On October 2017, Hunan Wetland Protection Regulation amendment plan was formally incorporated into the provincial people's Congress legislative plan</p> <p>Sector policy aligned with WPRHP and promoting biodiversity in sector decision making:</p> <p>Most of the provincial departments developed regulations and action plan towards the Dongting Lake wetland ecosystem and biodiversity as follows:</p> <p>In 2018, the Department of Water Resource and Transportation of Hunan Province carried out the three-year action for strengthening Dongting Lake ecological environment traffic, and regulating the illegal sand stone wharf.</p> <p>Agricultural Committee of Hunan Province announced document in 2018 promoting healthy aquaculture through regulating overall aquaculture in rivers, lakes, reservoirs and other natural waters to protect water ecosystem. "The China fishery administration action 2018 "was launched in Changde City West Dongting Lake for a synchronized law enforcement</p>	HS
	Indicator 3.1b : Poplar trees of 6,000 ha cleared in the core zones of nature reserves by the end of the project (suggested to be revised by MTE)	0 ha (in core zone) cleared	6,000 ha (in core zone) cleared	<p>88%</p> <p>The poplar plantation was stopped and requested to clear all the poplar trees in core zones of nature reserves by the Central Environmental Protection Supervision in July 2017.</p> <p>Up to date, more than 5,300 ha of poplar tree were removed from the core areas of NR in Dongting Lake. Restoration plan for 5514ha of the poplar tree removing areas was developed with billions of investment.</p>	HS

<p>Outcome 4:</p>	<p>Indicator 4.1: Awareness among the local population on DWE biodiversity value, use and wetland protection regulations increased to 30%</p>	<p>Less than 10% of the local population knows about wetland provincial regulation</p>	<p>30% of the local population knows about wetland provincial regulation</p>	<p>50% Over 20% increase of awareness estimated from data of NRs in 2018. East Dongting NR works with 3 We Chat public numbers to carry out We Chat public promotion on Dongting wetland conservation. During the Supervision visit to East Dongting Nature Reserve in 25-26 of April 2018, Xi Jinping, the General secretary of Chinese Communist Party, recognized the hard work of Nature Reserve and give some new expectations to the conservation in Dongting Lake, and agree that the Dongting Lake is a bird watching resort in China. The launching ceremony of "2018 Hunan bird flying" was held in March 11, 2018 at the East Dongting National Nature Reserve hosted by the provincial forestry department and the Yueyang municipal government. This action led to the establishment of 38 migratory bird protection stations in Hunan province, and 13 volunteer teams had been set up. 2017-2018 years wintering bird synchronized monitoring had been widely reported through the media. Dongting Lake Bird-Watching Festival with the theme of "Shared Clear Water and Blue Sky" opened on 8 December 2017 in the "China Bird-watching Capital" in Junshan District, Yueyang City. Thirteen bird-watching teams from home and abroad participated in the competition. The Hunan-GEF team, consisting of experts from Hunan GEF PMO, West Dongting Nature Reserve and Hengling Lake Nature Reserve, won the championship. The West Dongting NR organized series of publicity activities on the day of "Wetland Day", "bird loving week" and "environmental day" in 2018, there are more than 6000 people from NR and Local communities participated the events, more than 5000 copies of communication brochures were distributed to the local public.</p>	<p>S</p>
-------------------	---	--	--	--	----------

Table 1.b Outputs and Activities progress based on log frame work. Table prepared based on the PMO Self-assessment report, with simplification and validation by the MTE team.

- planned and completed (color green)
- on-going (color amber)
- Planned but uninitiated (color red).

Green= Achieved	Yellow= On target to be achieved	Red= Not on target to be achieved
Output	Activities	Validation by MTE
Component 1: Strengthening of institutional capacities for integrated monitoring and management of biodiversity in DWE		
Output 1.1.1: DLCC (replaced by Multi Sectoral Government Meeting (MSGM) strengthened by the end of the project with: i) a functioning secretariat in FDHP (two half-time staff, office equipment and operations budget); ii) agreed operation procedures; iii) agreed five-year work plan; and iii) at least one meeting held per year	1. Contract institutional specialist to support the process of making the DLCC (MSGM) operative	GEF Project Management Office (PMO) played the double role of both project management office and Provincial Multi Sectoral Government Joint Meeting (MSGM) Office of implementation of <i>Provincial Regulation of Hunan Wetland Protection and Restoration System</i> . Co-funding from Forest Department of Hunan Province supported some of the office staffs. The PMO has a regular operation system and now is preparing the 5-year work plan. According to the updated detailed biodiversity baseline and threat analysis, Hunan Provincial Government organized multiple meetings on Dongting Lake conservation and restoration. Through the joint action of expert group and nature reserves, the monitoring on the effects of three-year conservation action plan of Dongting Lake was initiated with the analysis of flagship species, protected area action plan, information system data.
	2. Two part-time staff seconded to the Secretariat of the DLCC (MSGM)	
	3. Office space provided by the FDHP and equipment procured	
	4. Make budgetary provisions for the operation of the Secretariat	
	5. Prepare through workshops and obtain agreement on operation procedures and five-year work plan for the DLCC (MSGM)	
	6. Organize and hold DLCC (MSGM) meeting	
	7. Monitor progress in implementation of DLCC (MSGM) five-year work plan	
Output 1.1.2: Updated detailed biodiversity baseline and threat analysis by the end of PY1 including	1. Contract consultancy services for updating biodiversity baseline and threats analysis and elaboration of the DWEMP through competitive processes	Biodiversity baseline was updated and threat analysis report was completed.
	2. Conduct three technical studies and elaborate three draft reports	

Output	Activities	Validation by MTE
<p>three technical reports on: a) DWE biodiversity and ecosystem services value and status; b) impacts on biodiversity from different sectors and response options; and c) options and priorities for land and water use plans of valuating biodiversity</p>	<p>3. Consult report findings and recommendations through at least 3 meetings per report with relevant sectors</p> <p>4. Finalize reports</p>	<p>The three technical reports on: (1) DWE biodiversity and ecosystem services value and status;(2) impacts on biodiversity from different sectors and response options; and (3) options and priorities for land and water use plans valuating biodiversity were preparing.</p>
<p>Output 1.1.3: Integrated DWE management plan (MP) incorporating valuation of biodiversity approved by DLCC by PY3 and under initial implementation by the end of the project</p>	<p>1. Formulation of mission and specific objectives for the DWEMP through public consultations and based on output 1.1.2</p> <p>2. Conduct financial and economic feasibility analysis of alternative response measures to mitigate DWE threats</p> <p>3. Elaborate draft DWEMP</p> <p>4. Consult draft DWEMP with DLCC members and other stakeholders and respond and incorporate comments and recommendations</p> <p>5. Develop monitoring system for the implementation of the DWEMP including agreed indicators for progress in achieving the objectives and outputs of the plan</p> <p>6. Finalize DWEMP</p> <p>7. Present the DWEMP for approval from the DLCC</p> <p>8. Implementation of DWEMP prioritized immediate actions</p> <p>9. Monitor the progress in implementation of the DWEMP</p>	<p>According to the new situation and the current management system and policy of Dongting Lake, a comprehensive monitoring of the present situation of Dongting Lake has been initiated to identify the new potential threats, and to develop strategies towards the policy, management system and legislation initiatives. Finally, a 5-10 year integrated management plan for Dongting Lake will be developed with scientific support, rule by law and regularized management.</p> <p>Based on the implementation results of the three-year conservation action of Dongting Lake since 2017, a supplementary plan for the management of Dongting Lake in the next 5-10 years has been initiated according to PMO.</p> <p>Current monitoring and analysis and assessment of Dongting Lake ecosystem are being implemented</p>
<p>Output 1.1.4: DWE Integrated Information Management System (IIMS) on status of biodiversity, ecosystem services, and socio-economic indicators is operating to provide data and analysis for DWE management and decision-making at</p>	<p>1. Designate focal points for IIMS from the provincial departments of Environmental Protection, Water Resources, Fisheries and Forestry, NRs, and CAS</p> <p>2. Contract information system specialist to support the design of the IIMS platform for integration of information and provide training to focal points in how to operate it</p> <p>3. Define data entries to the IIMS platform</p>	<p>In 2018, the Integrated Nature Reserve Information Management Platform of Dongting Lake Integrated Information Management System and Portal Website and Operation Management System were completed. Database needed by the system have been established including: (1) Basic</p>

Output	Activities	Validation by MTE
municipal, province and NR levels by PY2.	4. Design IIMS platform	<p>geographic data; (2) Satellite image data; (3) Protected area thematic data; (4) System operation results data. The training plan on system application, system management and operation system will be completed, and the training of relevant institutions will be launched in early 2019.</p> <p>Baseline data of biodiversity in Dongting Lake have been recorded.</p> <p>By 2018, through the internet, the general situation of protected areas, news, tourism services, laws and regulations and other information can be browsed and viewed through the portal website by the public users. Through the integrated information management platform of protected areas, special data such as boundary, river system, road, social economy, meteorology, hydrology and functional zoning of protected areas are provided to public users based on spatial information. As estimated from the website, there are hundred thousand of visitor to the site annually.</p>
	5. Train focal points in operating the platform	
	6. Record baseline level data in the IIMS	
	7. Discuss and agree on level of information disclosure to enable public access to the IIMS	
	8. Continued updating of the IIMS with data from on-going monitoring programmes	
Component 2: Strengthening of management effectiveness of DWE NRs network		
Output 2.1.1: Three local decrees on Administrative Measures for NR (AMNR), one for each of East, South and Hengling Dongting Lake (DL) NRs, were proclaimed by the end of PY2 (facilitating increased local government budget allocation).	1. Contracting of NR legal specialists for surveys and preparation of AMNR through competitive process	<p>The Administrative Measures for the South Dongting Nature Reserve was approved and implemented.</p> <p>Hengling Nature reserve initiated the drafting of Administrative Measures.</p> <p>Nature Reserve Administrative Measure workshops were organized according the plan.</p>
	2. Conduct three surveys on AMNR for East, South and Hengling DL NRs	
	3. Draft three AMNR for East, South and Hengling DL NRs	
	4. Hold nine local consultation workshops on draft AMNR, three for each NR (East, South, and Hengling)	
	6. Adjust three draft AMNRs to recommendations from the consultations	
	7. Hold three final validation workshops AMNR, one for each DL NRs East, South, and Hengling;	

Output	Activities	Validation by MTE
	<p>8. Adjust three advanced draft AMNRs to recommendations from the final validation</p> <p>9. Local governments (county for Hengling and Municipal for south and East NRs) proclaim AMNRs</p>	<p>Draft administrative measures for East Dongting Nature Reserve was revised and officially enacted by the city government in March 2019.</p>
<p>Output 2.1.2: West Dongting Lake NR and South Dongting Lake NR were upgraded from provincial NRs to National NRs and Hengling NR to Ramsar site by the end of PY3 (facilitating increased national government budget allocation)</p>	<p>1. Approve the upgrading of West DL NR to national NR by State Council.</p> <p>2. Contract consultancy services for the preparation of the biodiversity baseline and master plan for South DL NR through a competitive process</p> <p>3. Contract consultancy services for the preparation of biodiversity baseline survey and Ramsar site sheet for Hengling DL NR</p> <p>4. Update biodiversity baseline survey and master plan for South DL NR</p> <p>5. Update biodiversity survey for Hengling NR and prepare Ramsar information sheet</p> <p>6. Submit application for upgrading of South DL NR to SFA and follow up</p> <p>7. Submit application for recognition as Ramsar site for Hengling NR to SFA and follow up</p> <p>8. Approve the upgrading of South DL NR to national NR by State Council.</p> <p>9. Designation of Hengling NR as Ramsar site by State Council.</p>	<p>Biodiversity baseline survey of South Dongting Nature reserve was completed. Biodiversity survey was updated for Hengling NR and Ramsar information sheet was prepared</p> <p>Biodiversity baseline survey of South Dongting was completed. The Dongting National Park framework was completed.</p> <p>Hengling Lake application of Ramsar site is ready for submission; however, it would not be listed as priority in NFGA agenda, due to the facts that 3 Ramsar sites already exist in Dongting Lake Region. The upgrading of South Dongting Nature reserve will be aligned with the progress of the Dongting Nation Park.</p>
<p>Output 2.1.3 : Four five-year NR management plans (NRMP) updated for 2013-2018 and at least 20 NR staff trained in NR planning and management strengthening the DWE NR network</p>	<p>1. Contract NR management specialist to support the development of 4 NRMPs through a competitive process</p> <p>2. Establish four NR staff formulation teams to participate the NR Management Plan</p> <p>3. Hold on-the-job training for NR staff formulation team in NR planning and management</p> <p>4. Hold 16 objective, approach and priority setting consultations with local governments, community and private stakeholders, four for each DL NR</p> <p>5. Prepare 4 NRMPs</p> <p>6. Present NRMPs to local governments (East, South and Hengling NRMPs) and FDHP (West NR) for approval</p> <p>7. Approve 4 NRMPs</p> <p>8. Monitor progress in implementing NRMPs and update work plan</p>	<p>East Dongting Lake has reported its management plan for 2016-2020, while West Dongting Lake is revising its management plan for 2016-2020, adding new contents such as poplar tree clearance and restoration and ecotourism management. A working group has been set up in the South Dongting Nature Reserve. A Task Force was established for the management plan and the preliminary work plan was drafted. The draft of Hengling Nature Reserve Management Plan was basically completed. The relevant terms and details will be adjusted in</p>

Output	Activities	Validation by MTE
		<p>accordance with the institutional reform plan and relevant laws and regulations.</p> <p>East Dongting NR and West Dongting NR management plan were ready for local governments' approval.</p>
<p>Output 2.1.4: Capacities for NR management strengthened through: a) training of 100 NR staff in BD monitoring and conservation measures, ecotourism in NRs, law enforcement and co-management mechanism, and public communication and awareness raising; and b) upgrading of infrastructure, patrol and monitoring equipment in three DL NRs (West, South and Hengling).</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Purchase patrol and monitoring equipment for all four NRs 2. Construct animal rescue center, bird watching corridor, and visitor center in East DL NR, office building in Hengling NR, and office building and animal rescue center in South DL NR 3. Maintain equipment and infrastructure 4. Organize and execute study tours for 20 NR staff (two trips of 10) NR staff to other NRs in China with good examples of co-management models 5. Organize and execute study tours for 16 NR staff to other NRs in China with good examples of ecotourism activities 6. Organize and executed secondment of 8 NR staff for 1 month each to flagship examples of well managed wetland NR in China 7. Organize and execute training course of 20 NR staff for 6 days in public communication and environmental education 8. Organize and execute training course of 16 NR staff for 1 day (plus trainer accompanying study tour) in ecotourism in NR 9. Organize and execute training-by-doing of 8 NR staff in developing projects for fund raising and setting up planning and monitoring mechanism for project implementation 10. Organize and execute training-by-doing in the field (3 x 10 days) of 20 NR staff in wetlands biodiversity monitoring 	<p>Each nature reserve delivered a number of training activities every year. From the project statistic data from 2014-2018, more than a hundred of training and visiting activities were carried out on capacity building of monitoring, law enforcement, wetland management, wild life protection and rescue and other special talent of relating to conservation.</p> <p>The infrastructure of each Nature Reserve has been greatly improved, including bird watching tower, animal rescue center, education center and so on.</p> <p>A Milu (Pere's Davis Deer) rescue center was built up in East Dongting Nature Reserve.</p> <p>A new wetland ecological monitoring station near Banbian Lake, local black stock conserving station and new field office have been built in West Dongting Nature Reserve. Four communication billboard signs were set up on wetland conservation. A new wetland education center was built up which is located at the main street of the town where the West Dongting Nature Reserve.</p> <p>Capacity building for public education, environmental education and project fund raising need to further strengthened.</p>

Output	Activities	Validation by MTE
<p>Output 2.2.1: Four demonstration models for NR co-management implemented:</p> <p>a) agriculture integrated management model restoring paddy harvested fields as winter bird feeding ground on 700 ha involving 320 households in East DL NR;</p> <p>b) reed and poplar management model in South DL NR; c) organic fish farming (involving 400 households) and ecosystem and rights-based fisheries co-management (involving 500 households) models to support the restoration of fisheries resources and maintain the porpoises population in 1,800 ha in Hengling NR experimental zone;</p> <p>d) Ecotourism and bird habitat conservation model conserving 60 ha of birds' habitat and 70 additional households involved in ecotourism operations in West DL NR.</p>	1.a Contract socio-economic specialist for feasibility study of agriculture integrated management model	<p>Local community co-management in Caisang Lake and Matang village were developed. Two workshops were organized in Matang village in the late year of 2018, a preliminary agreement was reached among local township government, famers and commercial company in bird-friendly agriculture development. The agreement will be signed and technical support for the plan from Chinese Academy of Science was ready.</p> <p>In South Dongting lake, following on the poplar tree cleaning action in the NR core area, project experts and the South Dongting nature reserve jointly launched feasibility study of ecological restoration and sustainable development in the poplar tree cleaning up area. The enterprises and local farmers would be encouraged to participate in the restoration and sustainable development activities through provincial restoration project. The reed collectors were also encouraged to be involved.</p> <p>In Hengling Lake, socio-economic feasibility analysis has been completed. Economic model for various development approaches including eco-fisheries was defined in Qingshan Island. The environmental impact assessment of the development of ecological fisheries was conducted. It is sure that the contents of the project development will play a good role in the protection and restoration of the</p>
	2.a Conduct detailed socio-economic feasibility study	
	3. A Negotiate two agreements on agriculture integrated management between: 1) enterprise, farmers' community (20 households), CAS and East DL NR covering 30 ha; and 2) enterprise, farmers' community, Jianxin state farm, CAS and East DL NR covering 170 ha.	
	4.a Contract bird specialist for integrated bird-friendly cultivation planning	
	5.a Develop bird-friendly land cultivation plan	
	6.a Provide technical assistance and train farmers in implementation of the bird-friendly land cultivation plan	
	7.a Monitor outcome of the implementation of the bird-friendly land cultivation plan (increase in bird population and farmers' economic benefits)	
	8.a Document co-management model and lessons learned and	
	9. An Expanded the model to 500 additional ha. and more than 300 additional households	
	1.b Contract land use specialist for diagnostic and identification of alternative solutions for reed and poplar plantations in South DL NR	
	2. B Conduct participatory analysis of solution options for ecosystem fragmentation caused by reed farming and poplar plantation and incentives identified for reed farms and enterprises to engage in reduction of reed cultivation and poplar plantation areas.	
	3.b Consensus-based identification of incentives for reed farms and enterprises to engage in reduction of reed cultivation and poplar plantation areas	
	4.b Implement Solution options and incentives including engagement of reed farm staff in NR management	
	5.b Evaluate solution options and incentives and document co-management model with reed farmers	
1.c Contract socio-economist to conduct socio-economic feasibility study of aquaculture development plans		
2.c Contract aquaculture specialist for environmental feasibility study and development of investment plan for organic aquaculture		

Output	Activities	Validation by MTE
	3.c Contract fisheries co-management specialist for the development of sustainable fisheries management plan based on an ecosystem approach	<p>aquatic ecosystem around Qingshan Island. The community co-management assessment and the household survey were completed, and the co-management model was formulated. The agreement of joint development implementation among fishermen, protected areas and township government were under way which will involve 150 fishermen households. Private sector investment plan for 200 ha Eco fishery development area was developed.</p> <p>The development plan of ecotourism in the West Dongting Lake Reserve has been completed. Bird habitat in Banbian Lake has been restored.</p>
4.c Conduct detailed socio-economic feasibility study of organic aquaculture development plans and provide recommendations on best options for socio economic benefits including for vulnerable groups		
5.c Conduct environmental feasibility study of organic aquaculture development plans and prepare environmental management plan to insure the organic aquaculture plans are in harmony with the surrounding wetland ecosystems, develop environmental management plan for the aquaculture plans and other documentation needed for Qing tan township issuing the contract for use of water		
6.c Prepare draft of co-management investment plans and business model for organic aquaculture		
7.c Conduct consultation and negotiation workshops and signature of agreement on aquaculture business model between fishermen corporative (200 households) providing investment resources, NR providing resources for technical assistance, and Qing tan township issuing the contract for use of water;		
8.c Investment in organic fish farming infrastructure		
9.c Training for 270 fishermen in organic aquaculture practices, certification, marketing and business management		
10.c Monitor implementation of organic aquaculture business plans including indicators on rate of return on investments, inclusion of vulnerable groups, and trends in illegal fishing activities in Hengling NR		
11.c Document organic aquaculture model and lessons learned		
12.c Expand organic fish farming co-management model to 200 additional households;		
13. c Conduct legal, economic and social feasibility study and prepare sustainable fisheries management plan based on an ecosystem approach and rights-based management covering 800 ha in Hengling lake.		
14.c Hold consultation workshop and negotiated agreement on fisheries co-management plan signed between Xiangyin County Bureau of Fisheries, local fishermen communities (200 households), and Hengling NR		

Output	Activities	Validation by MTE
	<p>15.c Training for fishermen (270), County Bureau of Fishery and NR staff in ecosystem and rights-based co-management of fishery resources and biodiversity friendly fishing practices and equipment;</p> <p>16. c Monitor implementation of fisheries co-management plans including its outcomes (increase in population of Silver fish, carps and porpoises).</p> <p>17.c Document fisheries co-management model and lessons learned</p> <p>18. c Expand to 1,000 additional ha. and 300 additional households</p> <p>1.d Contract ecotourism specialist for the development of ecotourism co-management model</p> <p>2.d Conduct legal, socio-economic and environmental feasibility study and prepare bird habitat (60 ha) improvement and ecotourism development plan identifying needs of tourism facilities, organization and regulation of activities, and model for ecotourism operations;</p> <p>3.d Local fishermen trained (70 households) in developing ecotourism tour operations applying bird-friendly practices</p> <p>4.d Construct tourism facilities including bird watching room, tourism trails, knowledge boards, and floating bridges;</p> <p>5.d Monitor implementation of outcomes of the implementation of the ecotourism development plan</p> <p>5.e Document lessons learned and ecotourism co-management of birds biodiversity model</p> <p>5. f expand to 1,000 additional ha. and 300 fishermen households</p>	
<p>Output 2.2.2: Conservation of 5 flagship biodiversity species (finless porpoise, lesser white-fronted goose, black stork, Pere David's Deer, Whistle Swan) in a common effort among all NRs through: a) development and implementation of conservation action plan; b) restoration of 6,000 ha of habitat; c) systematic monitoring of population or proxy indicators for</p>	<p>1. Contract three specialists in selected flagship species (finless porpoises, Pere David's Deer, and water birds) for the preparation of species conservation action plans.</p> <p>2. Develop five species conservation action plans for DWE and establish collaboration with conservation plans for the selected species for other geographical areas they migrate to.</p> <p>3. Expand population monitoring system from East DL NR to South, West, and Hengling DL NRs and develop and implement a habitat monitoring component supported by GIS data base</p> <p>4. Monitor status of populations and habitats</p>	<p>As supported by GEF consultants, Hunan Dongting Flag Species conservation Action Plan was completed for FDHP, and will be the main action plan for Dongting Lake nature reserves during 2018-2019. Synchronized monitoring initiated by East Dongting Lake has become the annual joint action of the four major protected areas. Overall bird population increase and over</p>

Output	Activities	Validation by MTE
population size supported by a GIS data base	5. Implement priority actions from the five conservation action plans including: habitat restoration and improvement (linked to co-management models (output 2.2.1)), mitigation of threats (poisoning, hunting and trapping), public awareness, law enforcement.	400 ha habitat in Dongting Lake were greatly improved. For the project objective, the flag species conservation needs to coordinate closely with local community project for both ecological and socio-economic benefits.
Component 3: Mainstreaming of biodiversity conservation in key sectors		
Output 3.1.1: Amendment of Wetland Protection Regulation of Hunan Province (WPRHP) presented to the Provincial People's Congress by PY3 including in particular provisions for: a) integrated management of wetland biodiversity and ecosystems; and b) compensation mechanism for conservation of wetland biodiversity and ecosystem services	<p>1. Contract Natural Resources Economist to support the preparation of the amendment of the WPRHP and alignment of sector policies</p> <p>2. Contract Environmental legal specialist to support the preparation of the amendment of the WPRHP and alignment of sector policies</p> <p>3. Conduct two consultations supporting the development of an amendment of WPRHP: one at grassroots level and one at Municipality or provincial level.</p> <p>4. Prepare first draft of the amendment</p> <p>5. Present first draft to the Provincial Legislation office</p> <p>6. Conduct two consultations: one within Hunan Province and one outside Hunan Province.</p> <p>7. Conduct two consultation workshops on the amendment: one for local governments and one for other relevant provincial sectors</p> <p>8. Propose the second draft of the amendment to the Provincial People's Congress.</p> <p>9. Conduct two consultations</p> <p>10. Convene two conferences on the amendment: one for relevant sectors and one for congress men/women</p> <p>11. Finalize amendment</p> <p>12. Pass and proclaim amendment</p>	<p>The amendment of Hunan Wetland Protection Regulations was formally incorporated into the Hunan Provincial People's Congress Legislative Plan in September 2017.</p> <p>The amendment of Hunan Wetland Protection Regulations was ready for approval of Hunan Provincial People's Congress, according to PMO.</p>
Output 3.1.2: At least two sector policies (fisheries, reed and/or poplar plantation) are aligned with WPRHP, the Integrated WEMP and the four AMNR decrees and	1. Conduct four sector workshops on the alignment of two sector policies	Through the International Symposium on Dongting Lake, the policy and management system to ensure the coordination of protection and development of Dongting

Output	Activities	Validation by MTE
RMPs at local and provincial levels by the end of the project		<p>Lake were discussed and studied. The GEF project experts have begun to monitor the implementation of the new policies of the departments, and further put forward countermeasures to promote the scientific and legal governance of Dongting Lake.</p> <p>The conservation of Dongting Lake was incorporated into most of the new policies announced by the provincial governments.</p>
Output 3.1.3: Practical skills of 360 provincial and local government officials in enforcement of wetland conservation and sustainable use regulations enhanced	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Contract training facilitators 2. Prepare training agenda and material 3. Conduct 6 2-day training courses with 30 trainees for each and prepare training report with participants evaluations 	<p>Practical skills of 110 of provincial and local governmental officials were trained with the support of co-fund. GEF project is preparing training plan of 2019 together with the government on capacity of Dongting Wetland Conservation and Green Development.</p>
Output 3.1.4: Increased capacity of 40 provincial and local government officials and private sector representatives in development and implementation of biodiversity conservation measures and practices in fishery management, pollution control from paper mills, sand mining and land-use planning for reed and poplar plantations	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Select participants and prepare study visit plan for provincial and local government officials and private sector representatives to learn practical solutions for wetland biodiversity conservation and participants selected 2. Organize logistics and conduct 3 7-day study tours with 8-12 participants for each 3. Prepare study tour results report with participants evaluation 	<p>The learning and training planned to be conducted in 2019 according to PMO.</p>
Component 4: Environmental education and awareness		
Output 4.1.1: 50,000 brochures distributed and system of 20 billboard signs set up on: a) flagship species conservation; b) rules and regulations for protection and use of wetland biodiversity; c) success stories on organic aquaculture, ecotourism,	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Contract communication firm for the design of brochures 2. Contract communication firm for the design of billboard signs 3. Prepare text inputs and review the design of brochures and billboard signs before final editing and graphic design 4 Set up billboard signs and distribute brochures 	<p>The billboard was setup by Project Management Office and Nature Reserve</p> <p>More than 10,000 copy of Nature Reserve brochures were distributed to the local people.</p>

Output	Activities	Validation by MTE
ecosystem and rights-based management of fisheries, and bird-friendly cultivation plan; and d) NR demarcation		The visiting center of East Dongting NR was updated and planned to officially launch in 2019.
<p>Output 4.1.2: Infrastructure and display of visitors and other education centers improved including: a) construction of three visitors and education centers of West, South and Hengling DL NRs; b) improvement of displays in four centers; and c) upgrading of displays in Qingshan polder organic aquaculture success story exhibition hall (West DL NR)</p>	<p>1. Prepare technical specifications, call for price offers and procure displays for visitor centers</p> <p>2. Monitor that co-financing investments have been realized in visitors and education centers infrastructure</p>	<p>By the end of 2018, the display of Visiting Center of West Dongting Nature Reserve was done with an investment of more than 6 million Chinese yuan. It is expected that the publicity of the Visiting Center will be officially opened in early 2019, according to PMO.</p> <p>The 2018 Bird watching Festival and the International Symposium on Dongting Lake were held simultaneously in East Dongting Nature Reserve, Yueyang City with a huge social impact. The original bird-watching competition in East Dongting Nature Reserve becomes a bird-watching festival of Hunan Province and Yueyang City. More than 800 persons participated in the Bird watching Festival. The GEF team also participated in the Bird watching Competition.</p> <p>The visiting Center of Hengling Lake NR need to be further developed.</p>
<p>Output 4.1.3: Special campaign and events organized and conducted including: a) 20 summer holiday university volunteers camps in each of the four NRs; and b) 40-60 campaigns on special days such as annual Wetlands day, annual Bird week, bi-annual race</p>	<p>1. Contract public communications specialists</p> <p>2. Improve the design and planning of special events and campaign and prepare programme</p> <p>3. Select participants for summer holiday university volunteers camp</p> <p>4. Implement special events and camps and secure sustainable budgets for these events after the end of the project</p>	<p>Summer camps of two universities to East and West Dongting Nature Reserves were organized by the project communication specialist for environmental education to local people and field investigation on Nature Reserve development. At the same time, more than 7 universities participated in the activity such as Central South University of Forestry and Technology,</p>

Output	Activities	Validation by MTE
		<p>Hunan Agriculture University, Changsha University of Science and Technology.</p> <p>After the General Secretary Xi Jinping's visit to the East Dongting Nature Reserve, the external influence of the Nature Reserve was expanding day by day, since the second half of 2018, more than 100 delegations with more than 5000 visitors. from central, provincial and local governments visited Dongting Lake Reserve,</p> <p>Further sustainable activities for university students need to be developed.</p>
<p>Output 4.1.4: Curricula on DWE biodiversity conservation and sustainable use included in 20 middle schools in counties and townships around the lake reaching 30,000 students.</p>	<p>1. Contract service provider for the development of the middle school curricula</p>	<p>Summer camps of two universities to East and West Dongting Nature Reserves were organized by the project communication specialist for environmental education to local people and field investigation on Nature Reserve development. At the same time, more than 7 universities participated in the activity such as Central South University of Forestry and Technology, Hunan Agriculture University, Changsha University of Science and Technology.</p> <p>After the General Secretary Xi Jinping's visit to the East Dongting Nature Reserve, the external influence of the Nature Reserve was expanding day by day, since the second half of 2018, more than 100 delegations with more than 5000 visitors. from central, provincial and local governments visited Dongting Lake Reserve,</p> <p>Half of activities were completed. Further sustainable activities for university students need to be developed.</p>
	<p>2. Prepare draft middle school curricula and education material</p>	
	<p>3. Conduct consultation workshop on middle school curricula</p>	
	<p>4. Implement the curricular in schools around the DWE</p>	

Output	Activities	Validation by MTE
Component 5: M&E and information dissemination		
Output 5.1.1: Project monitoring system providing six-monthly reports on progress in achieving project outputs and outcomes	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Contract CTA to support setting up and implementing the project monitoring and reporting system 2. Monitor project progress in the field and by reviewing consultants reports 3. Prepare six-monthly project progress reports 4. Provide inputs to the annual PIR 	Done as requested by FAO and GEF procedures.
Output 5.1.2: Midterm and final evaluation reports	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Provide inputs to the TOR for midterm evaluation 2. Support the organization and provide inputs for the midterm evaluation mission 3. Organize midterm evaluation workshop and define and implement eventual adjustments in project implementation strategy 4. Provide inputs for TOR for final evaluation 5. Support the organization and provide inputs for the final evaluation mission 6. Organize final evaluation workshop and define and implement strategy for sustaining project results 	Mid-term evaluation is in the process, and the mid-term evaluation report will be finalized before the end of May 2019 according to FAO.
Output 5.1.3: Project “best-practices” and “lessons-learned” in relation to co-management models, integrated DWE management experience, mainstreaming of wetland biodiversity conservation in sectors disseminated via publications, project website and others.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Establish project website 2. Update project website 3. Prepare and disseminate six-monthly project newsletter 4. Prepare and publish publication on experiences and “best practices” in DWE integrated management 5. Prepare and publish publication on “best practices” and “lessons learned” in mainstreaming conservation of wetland biodiversity in sectors 6. Prepare and publish publication on “best practices” and lessons learned in co-management models 	The project website has not been set up to share the BMPs from the project. More efforts are needed on the BMPs summarizing and dissemination after mid-term evaluation.

Table 1. c. Project outcomes linked to outputs:

Note: The changes of the outputs are highlighted with Yellow Color with explanations and justification of the changes.

Outcomes	Baseline	Explanations and justification of the changes	Data Collection and Reporting	
			Means of verification	Responsible for Data Collection
Outcome 1.1: DLCC is fulfilling its function coordinating the implementation of the DWEMP and at least two key biodiversity threats addressed (sand mining threatening porpoises, poplar plantations, and/or un-sustainable fisheries) by the end of project.	No issue addressed by the DLCC		DLCC minutes; annual DWE MP implementation progress reports; PPR; project midterm and final evaluations	PMO/F DHP; midterm and final evaluations teams
Output 1.1.1: Provincial Multi-sectors Governmental Joint Committee for Wetland Protection and Restoration System strengthened by the end of the project with: i) a functioning secretariat in FDHP (two half-time staffs, office equipment and operations budget); ii) agreed operations procedures; iii) agreed five-year work plan; and iii) at least one meeting per year held	A circular creating the DLCC and appointing the chairman and members was issued by the provincial government in 2007. However, DLCC does not have operations budget and procedures or a work plan and no meetings have been held	Provincial Multi-sectors Governmental Joint Committee for Wetland Protection and Restoration System has been setup to replace the DLCC as the institution responsible for the integrated wetland management in Dongting Lake region, taking the new national policy opportunity for wetland conservation and restoration system (Office of State Council, September, 2017), and the change was approved by PSC.	Budget assigned for DLCC Secretariat; operations procedures; 5-year Work Plan and its annual implementation progress reports; minutes of meetings; PPR	PMO/F DHP
Output 1.1.2: Updated detailed biodiversity baseline and threat analysis by the end of PY1 including three technical reports on: a) DWE biodiversity and	Separate studies exist on various aspects of the DWE and pressures but findings are not integrated in management planning. Among others there is a study on the valuation of DWE ecosystem services that needs to		Technical reports; minutes from focus group consultations; PPR	PMO/F DHP; Project Expert groups

Outcomes	Baseline	Explanations and justification of the changes	Data Collection and Reporting	
			Means of verification	Responsible for Data Collection
ecosystem services value and status; b) impacts on biodiversity from different sectors and response options; and c) options and priorities for land and water use plans valuating biodiversity	be updated			
Output 1.1.3: Integrated DWE management plan (MP) incorporating valuation of biodiversity approved by DLCC by PY3 and under initial implementation by the end of the project	A framework master plan exists but lacks detailed actions and implementation capacity among relevant agencies at different levels need to be strengthened. Stakeholders also lack mechanisms to participate in DWE management planning.		Minutes from stakeholder consultations and comments received; Draft and final DWE MP; MP implementation monitoring report; PPR	PMO/F DHP; Experts supporting the formulation of the DWE MP
Output 1.1.4: DWE Integrated Information Management System (IIMS) on status of biodiversity, ecosystem services, and socio-economic indicators is operating providing data and analysis for DWE management and decision-making at municipal, province and NR levels by PY2.	Information systems and data are owned by different public institutions while protocols and platform for sharing do not exist.		Bi-annual status reports produced by the IIMS; existence of platform; Training reports detailing number of staff trained and organizations represented; PPR	PMO/F DHP; Information system expert; IIMS focal points
Outcome 2.1a: Improvement in management effectiveness of NRs by the end of the project monitored through the BD management effectiveness tracking tool: (a) NR management effectiveness assessment improved for: East Dongting Lake (DL) from 61 to 70; West DL from 54 to 70; South DL from 56 to 68; and Hengling from 53 to 66; (b) threat score	Management effectiveness assessment scores: East DL 61; West DL 54; South DL 56; and Hengling 53 Threat score: East DL 56; West DL 63; South DL 57; and Hengling 61		BD management effectiveness tracking tool; Midterm and final evaluations	PMO/F DHP; NR bureaus; local governments

Outcomes	Baseline	Explanations and justification of the changes	Data Collection and Reporting	
			Means of verification	Responsible for Data Collection
decreased for: East DL from 56 to 47; West DL from 63 to 51; South DL from 57 to 50; and Hengling from 61 to 40				
Outcome 2.1b: 50% increase in national and local governmental budget allocations to PA management	20 million/year		PA budgets; Midterm and final evaluations	PMO/F DHP; NR bureaus; local governments
Output 2.1.1: Three local decrees on Administrative Measures for NR (AMNR), one for each of East, South and Hengling Dongting Lake (DL) NRs, proclaimed by the end of PY2 (facilitating increased local government budget allocation)	The NRs are established by provincial and central government approval and West DL also has a county decree. For South, East and Hengling DL NRs there has been no progress so far on local decrees on AMNR		Survey reports; Draft and final AMNR; proclamation of AMNR; PPR.	PMO/F DHP; NR bureaus; Forestry bureaus at provincial, municipality, and county level
Output 2.1.2: South Dongting Lake NR and Hengling Lake NR are integrated into the function zoning and master plan of Dongting Lake National Park by PY4 (facilitating increased national government budget allocation).	West DL NR has presented documentation (master plan, biodiversity baseline survey) and application to SFA. South DL NR and Hengling NR are planning to start the documentation and application procedure in 2013. Both NRs need updating of their biodiversity baseline.	West Dongting Lake NR was promoted to National Nature Reserve in 2013, before the official launch of the project. South Dongting Lake Nature Reserve will not continue to work on the upgrading from Provincial Nature Reserve to National Nature Reserve; and Hengling Lake PNR will not continue to work on Ramsar Site listing. Because	Biodiversity baseline survey and master; Ramsar information sheet; Applications; provincial and central government approval; PPR	PMO/F DHP; NR bureaus; Forestry bureaus at provincial, municipality, and county level

Outcomes	Baseline	Explanations and justification of the changes	Data Collection and Reporting	
			Means of verification	Responsible for Data Collection
		the provincial authorities of forest and wetland has started the process for National Park application, and the 4 NR's staff are all in favor of the National Parks.. The output changes of the South Dongting Lake and Hengling Lake Nature here need to be approved by PSC.		
Output 2.1.3: Four five-years NR management plans (NRMP) updated for 2013-2018 and at least 20 NR staff trained in NR planning and management strengthening the DWE NR network	The four DL NRs have 15-years master plans but they are outdated and do not provide concrete priorities, activities and work planning for a more short and medium term period (five years) such as much needed zoning and use regulation and co-management mechanisms.		Minutes of consultation workshops; Five-years NRMPs; NRMPs implementation progress reports; PPR	PMO/F DHP; NR bureaus
Output 2.1.4: Capacities for NR management strengthened through: a) training of 100 NR staff in BD monitoring and conservation measures, ecotourism in NRs, law enforcement and co-management mechanism, and public communication and awareness raising; and b) up-grating of infrastructure, patrol and monitoring equipment in three DL NRs (West, South and Hengling).	Staff trained mostly in bird monitoring and protection during the UNDP/GEF project, but there has been changes in staff and capacities need to be broadened to other species and issues important for NR management. Only East DL NR is adequately equipped for monitoring and provision of services to visitors including a training center and 4 management stations		Training participation lists and final test results; Verification of infrastructure and equipment in situ; PPR	PMO/F DHP; NR bureaus
Outcome 2.2.a: Improved biodiversity and endangered species indicators by the end of the project in DWE:	(i) Total migratory bird visitation 104,000-130,000 (2008-2012); (ii) Finless porpoise: 100-150 in DWE (2011), ca. 800 total population; (iii) Lesser white-fronted goose		Population monitoring system; Final evaluations	PMO/F DHP; NR bureaus; local

Outcomes	Baseline	Explanations and justification of the changes	Data Collection and Reporting	
			Means of verification	Responsible for Data Collection
(i) increase in total bird visitation by 10% in the four DL NRs; (ii) finless porpoise population maintained; (iii) lesser white-fronted goose population maintained; (iv) black stork population maintained; (v) 5% increase in Pere Davis deer population; (vi) Whistling Swan population maintained; (vii) increase from 2 to 5% appearance of Silver Fish in monitoring caches (ecosystem health indicator)	(Anser erythropus): 18,000 in DWE (mostly in East DL NR) which is 50% of total global population; (iv) Black stork (ciconia nigra): 23 in DWE (Dec. 2011), 24,000-34,000 East Asia population; (v) Pere David's Deer (Elaphurus Davidianus): 25 in DWE (Jan 2012), 3000 global population; (vi) Whistling Swan (Cygnus columbianus): 800-1,000 in DWE (Nov-Dec 2011), 86,000 global population; (vii) Silver fish (near endangered in IUCN Read List): 2% appearance rate in monitoring catches in DWE (2011)			governments
Outcome 2.2.b: Improved income indicators for households (of which 60% are represented by women as the main participant and beneficiary) involved in co-management demonstration models: (i) 320 farming households have increased their income with at least 30% in East DL NR from bird-friendly rice production; (ii) 400 house-holds involved in organic fish farming and 500 households involved in rights based fisheries co-management to support the restoration of fisheries resources have increased their income with at least 100% in Hengling NR experimental zone; (iii) 70 households have increased their income with at least 100% in West DL NR from ecotourism operations and bird habitat conservation	2.2.b (i) income baseline to be established in PY1		Co-management models monitoring reports; Midterm and final evaluations	PMO/F DHP; NR bureaus; local governments; farmers and fishers

Outcomes	Baseline	Explanations and justification of the changes	Data Collection and Reporting	
			Means of verification	Responsible for Data Collection
<p>Output 2.2.1: Four demonstration models for NR co-management implemented:</p> <p>a) agriculture integrated management model restoring paddy harvested fields as winter bird feeding ground on 700 ha involving 320 households of Matang Town in East DL NR ;</p> <p>b) reed and poplar management model in South DL NR;</p> <p>c) Eco-friendly aquatic farming and ecotourism models for better livelihood based on co-management of 400ha (involving 150 households in the community of Qingshan Island) to support the restoration of wetland and water bird habitats in Hengling NR experimental zone;</p> <p>d) ecotourism and bird habitat conservation model conserving 60 ha of birds habitat and 70 additional households involved in ecotourism operations in West DL NR.</p>	<p>a) 700 ha converted to vegetable production in winter season reducing migratory birds feeding area in NR experimental zone. Preliminary economic, social and biodiversity feasibility study has been conducted. Framework of agreement has been discussed among partners.</p> <p>b) 10,000 ha of monoculture of poplar and reed in NR core zone are fragmenting habitats. 10 years compensation contracts with poplar enterprises for cutting threes and not planting new threes runs out in 2014.</p> <p>c) 200 households involved in illegal fishing in Hengling NR and experimental zone resulting in fish stocks under high pressure as evidenced by the silver fish ecosystem health indicator (2% appearance rate in monitoring catches in Henglinghu NR) and the decreasing population of porpoises (20-30 individuals left in Hengling lake which might be difficult to monitor but it feeds on 4 carp species as an important food source which can be monitored, baseline to be established in PY1).</p> <p>d) Illegal fishing activities by 70 fishing vessels are disturbing the birds in the West DL NR core area. Good opportunities for ecotourism and birds biodiversity co-management because of high concentration of birds and diversified habitat which could reduce the pressure from illegal fishing and bring local economic benefits from birds biodiversity conservation. A pilot experience exist from Banbian Lake involving local population in bird conservation.</p>	<p>a) The demonstration area need to be changed from the Jianxin Farm in Junshan District to Matang Town in Yueyang County, due the land use change from paddy field and fish ponds to hydroponic farms (vegetable), which is not suitable for common crane and geese for wintering, Whereas, Matang Town is still the landscape of paddy field and fish ponds.</p> <p>c) Due the fishing ban policy in Yangtze River Basin has been applied to all Dongting Lake Region, including the open water surrounding the Qingshan Island, so no fishing is allowed including organic fish farming. The fishing ban policy provide better conservation benefit of fishery resource and porpoise than organic fish farming of the current 1800 ha. The proposed eco-friendly aquatic farming will be carried out in the degraded wetland</p>	<p>PPR and:</p> <p>a) Training results reports; cultivation plan monitoring reports; report documenting co-management model with farmers</p> <p>b) Assessment report on solution options and incentives; report documenting co-management model with reed farmers</p> <p>c) Economic and social feasibility study; environmental assessment; agreed investment and business plan and monitoring report; agreed sustainable fisheries management plan and monitoring reports; training results reports; documentation of co-management model with fisheries community</p> <p>d) Birds habitat improvement and</p>	<p>PMO/F DHP; NR bureaus; local governments</p>

Outcomes	Baseline	Explanations and justification of the changes	Data Collection and Reporting	
			Means of verification	Responsible for Data Collection
		(from cropland restoration after the floods in 1998) with an area of 400 ha. Actually, there are only 280 households in the community, not 400 or 500 households, and 150 households are more than 50% of local community.	ecotourism development plan and monitoring reports; verification of infrastructure in-situ; training results reports	
Output 2.2.2: Conservation of 5 flagship biodiversity species (finless porpoise, lesser white-fronted goose, black stork, Pere David's Deer, Whistle Swan) in a common effort among all NRs through: a) development and implementation of conservation action plan; b) restoration of 6,000 ha of habitat; c) systematic monitoring of population or proxy indicators for population size supported by a GIS data base	No specific action plans for flagship species have been established. CAS (Institute of aquatic biology) has a monitoring programme on finless porpoise and ex-situ conservation has started but no results yet. UNDP/GEF project (GEF ID: 623) established population monitoring system for East DL (which did not include habitat), but no monitoring system exist for at NR network and DWE ecosystem level.		Species conservation action plans; Monitoring reports; PPR	PMO/F DHP; NR bureaus; local governments
Outcome 3.1.a: BD O2 tracking tool score on biodiversity conservation integration in policies and regulations increased from 17 to 23 (out of 36 possible) for the sectors influencing on DWE	17		Legislations and regulations; BD O2 tracking tool	PMO/F DHP; midterm and final evaluation teams
Outcome 3.1.b: Poplar trees of 6,000 ha cleared in the core zones of nature reserves by the end of the project	0 ha (in core zone) cleared up.	The poplar plantation was stopped and requested to clear all the poplar trees in core zones of nature reserves by the Central Environmental Protection	Poplar plantation survey; Midterm and final valuations	PMO/F DHP; midterm and final evaluation teams

Outcomes	Baseline	Explanations and justification of the changes	Data Collection and Reporting	
			Means of verification	Responsible for Data Collection
		<p>Supervision in July 2017.</p> <p>Baseline of poplar plantation in Dongting Lake area was 26,600 ha, in which 6,000 ha in the core zones of nature reserve, and 17,700 ha in the buffer zone. The Baseline of the poplar plantation area 400,000 ha was also wrong, should be changed to 6,000 ha in core zones of nature reserves.</p> <p>The changes of the Output 3.1.b and baseline need to be approved by PSC.</p>		
<p>Output 3.1.1: Amendment of Wetland Protection Regulation of Hunan Province (WPRHP) presented to the Provincial People's Congress by PY3 including in particular provisions for: a) integrated management of wetland biodiversity and ecosystems; and b) compensation mechanism for conservation of wetland biodiversity and ecosystem services</p>	<p>WPRHP proclaimed in 2005 but without clear provisions for unified coordination and effective management of wetland biodiversity and ecosystems and mechanisms for compensation for biodiversity and ecosystem services conservation. Some consultations have been conducted on wetland conservation as a whole, but none supporting an amendment of the WPRHP.</p>		<p>Consultation reports; Draft and final amendment; proclamation of amendment; PPR.</p>	<p>PMO/F DHP Forestry sector bureaus at provincial, municipality, and county level</p>
<p>Output 3.1.2: At least two sector policies (fisheries, reed and/or poplar plantation) are aligned with WPRHP, the Integrated DWEMP and the four AMNR decrees and NRMPs at local and provincial level by the end of the project</p>	<p>Conflicting regulation between NR master plans and regulations and sector policies and regulations</p>		<p>Consultation workshop reports; policy documents; PPR</p>	<p>PMO/F DHP; sector bureaus</p>

Outcomes	Baseline	Explanations and justification of the changes	Data Collection and Reporting	
			Means of verification	Responsible for Data Collection
Output 3.1.3: Practical skills of 360 provincial and local government officers in enforcement of wetland conservation and sustainable use regulations enhanced	Trainings exist but without specific focus on compliance with wetland regulation		Training report and test results of participants; PPR	PMO/F DHP
Output 3.1.4: Increased capacity of 40 provincial and local government officials and private sector representatives in development and implementation of biodiversity conservation measures and practices in fishery management, pollution control from paper mills, sand mining and land-use planning for reed and poplar plantations	There is knowledge on technical solutions and biodiversity friendly practices among technical staff but managers lack knowledge on good examples to support their decision-making		Workshop and study visit reports; PPR	PMO/F DHP
Outcome 4.1: Awareness among the local population on DWE biodiversity value, use and wetland protection regulations increased to 30%.	Less than 10% of the local population knows about wetland provincial regulation		Awareness survey; midterm and final evaluation	PMO/F DHP; NR bureaus; midterm and final evaluations teams
Output 4.1.1: 50,000 brochures distributed and system of 20 billboard signs set up on: a) flagship species conservation; b) rules and regulations for protection and use of wetland biodiversity; c) success stories on organic aquaculture, ecotourism, ecosystem and rights based management of fisheries, and bird-friendly cultivation plan; and d) NR demarcation	Four brochures; two on East and South DL NR in general, one on some specific water bird species, and one on ecotourism in West DL NR 16 billboard signs in DWE marking core zone and communicating some rules and important habitats		Brochures disseminated; billboard signs in situ; PPR	PMO/F DHP; NR bureaus

Outcomes	Baseline	Explanations and justification of the changes	Data Collection and Reporting	
			Means of verification	Responsible for Data Collection
Output 4.1.2: Infrastructure and display of visitors and other education centers improved including: a) construction of three visitors and education centers of West, South and Hengling DL NRs; b) improvement of displays in four centers; and c) upgrading of displays in Qingshan polder organic aquaculture success story exhibition hall (West DL NR)	<p>There are only 2 useful visitors and education centers in 4 NRs; The infrastructure needs improvements to meet the needs.</p>		<p>Visitors and education centers and exhibition hall verified in situ; Equipment list of centers; PPR</p>	<p>PMO/F DHP; NR bureaus; Hanshou Qingshan polder co-management association</p>
Output 4.1.3: Special campaign and events organized and conducted including: a) 20 summer holiday university volunteers camps in each of the four NRs; and b) 40-60 campaigns on special days such as annual Wetlands day, annual Bird week, bi-annual Bird watching race	<p>The activities are already been done, however improvements are needed in design, planning and organization of the events</p>		<p>Media reports; Camp and event agenda and summary report; PPR</p>	<p>PMO/F DHP; NR bureaus</p>
Output 4.1.4: Curricula on DWE biodiversity conservation and sustainable use included in 20 middle schools in counties and townships around the lake reaching 30,000 students.	<p>No curricula</p>		<p>Curricula; verification of school classes in situ; PPR</p>	<p>PMO/F DHP; NR bureaus</p>
Outcome 5.1: Project implementation based on results based management and increased receptivity and adoption of DWE approach to "mainstreaming" biodiversity conservation in sector planning both in China and elsewhere			<p>Midterm and final evaluations</p>	<p>PMO/F DHP, FAO</p>
Output 5.1.1: Project monitoring system	<p>Project results framework with project output and outcome</p>		<p>PPRs</p>	<p>PMO/F DHP</p>

Outcomes	Baseline	Explanations and justification of the changes	Data Collection and Reporting	
			Means of verification	Responsible for Data Collection
providing six-monthly reports on progress in achieving project outputs and outcomes	indicators, targets and baseline			
Output 5.1.2: Midterm and final evaluation reports	N/A		Evaluation reports	PMO/F DHP, FAO
Output 5.1.3: Project "best-practices" and "lessons-learned" in relation to co-management models, integrated DWE management experience, mainstreaming of wetland biodiversity conservation in sectors disseminated via publications, project website and others.	N/A		Publications; number of visitors on website; PPR	PMO/F DHP

3 Annex 3. List of MTE questions

1.Relevance (rating required)	1.1 Are the 4 project components and objectives congruent with the GEF focal areas/operational program strategies, China environment priorities and FAO-China Country Programming Framework? 1.2 Has there been any change in the relevance of the project since its design, such as new national policies, plans or programs that affect the relevance of the project objectives and goals? If so, are there any changes that need to be made to the project to make it more relevant?
2. Effectiveness Achievement of project results (rating required)	2.1 (component 1) To what extent has the project contributed to <i>the strengthening of Institutional capacities for integrated monitoring and management of biodiversity in DWE</i> ? 2.2 (component 2) To what extent has the project contributed to <i>the strengthening of management effectiveness of DWE NRs network</i> ? 2.3 (component 3) To what extent has the project contributed to <i>the mainstreaming of conservation of biodiversity in key sectors in DWE</i> ? 2.4 (component 4) To what extent has the project contributed to <i>environmental education and awareness</i> ? 2.5 Are there any unintended results? 2.6 (Likelihood of impact) Are there any barriers or other risks that may prevent future progress towards and the eventual achievement of <i>securing the conservation of biodiversity of global importance in the Dongting Lake</i> ?
3.Efficiency (rating required)	3.1 To what extent has the project been implemented efficiently, cost-effectively, and management been able to adapt to any changing conditions to improve the efficiency of project implementation? 3.2 To what extent has the project built on existing agreements, initiatives, data sources, synergies, complementarities with other projects and partnerships, etc., and avoid duplication of similar activities of other groups? 3.3 Is the project cost-effective? How does the project cost/time versus output/outcomes equation compare to that of similar projects?
4.Sustainability (rating required)	4.1 (Sustainability) What is the likelihood that the project results will continue to be useful or will remain after the end of the project? What are the key risks that may affect the sustainability of the project results and benefits (consider financial, socio-economic, institutional and governance, and environmental)?
5.Factors affecting progress (rating required)	5.1 (Project design) Is the project design appropriate for delivering the expected outcomes? Is the logic coherent and clear? To what extent are the project's objectives and components, clear, practical and feasible within the timeframe? 5.2 (Project execution and management) To what extent did the Forestry Department of Hunan Province effectively discharge its role and responsibilities related to the management and administration of the project? What have been the main challenges in relation to the management and administration of the project and what changes are needed to improve delivery in the second half of the project? 5.3 (Financial management and Co-financing) What have been the challenges related to the financial management of the project and to what extent has the pledged co-financing been delivered? 5.4 (Project oversight, implementation role) To what extent has FAO delivered on project identification, concept preparation, appraisal, preparation, approval and start-up, oversight and supervision? 5.5 (Partnerships and stakeholder engagement) Have other actors, such as civil society, indigenous population or private sector, been sufficiently involved in project design and implementation, and what has been the effect of their involvement/non-involvement on the project results? What are strengths and challenges of the project's partnerships? 5.6 (Communication and knowledge management) How effective has the project been in communicating and promoting its key messages and results to partners, stakeholders and a general audience? How can this be improved? 5.7 (M&E design) Is the M&E plan practical and sufficient? 5.8 (M&E implementation) Does the M&E system operate as per the M&E plan? Has information been gathered in a systematic manner? To what extent has information generated by the M&E system during project implementation been used to adapt and improve project planning and execution, achievement of outcomes and ensure sustainability?
6. Cross-cutting dimensions	6.1 (Gender and minority groups) To what extent were gender considerations taken into account in designing and implementing the project? 6.2 (Environmental and social safeguards) To what extent were environmental and social concerns taken into consideration in the design and implementation of the project?

4 Annex 4. Project architecture

FAO-China GEF Project Operation Structure and key functions

Version: 2 Feb 2018

