519/1

Understanding and applying risk analysis in aquaculture

A manual for decision-makers







Understanding and applying risk analysis in aquaculture

FAO FISHERIES AND AQUACULTURE TECHNICAL PAPER

519/1

A manual for decision-makers

by James Richard Arthur FAO Consultant Barriere, British Columbia, Canada

Melba G. Bondad-Reantaso

Fishery Resources Officer (Aquaculture) Aquaculture Management and Conservation Service FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Department Rome, Italy

Marnie L. Campbell

Associate Professor Australian Maritime College University of Tasmania Launceston, Tasmania, Australia

Chad L. Hewitt

Professor Australian Maritime College University of Tasmania Launceston, Tasmania, Australia

Michael J. Phillips

Senior Scientist WorldFish Center Penang, Malaysia

Rohana P. Subasinghe

Senior Fishery Resources Officer (Aquaculture) Aquaculture Management and Conservation Service FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Department Rome, Italy

FOOD AND AGRICULTURE ORGANIZATION OF THE UNITED NATIONS Rome, 2009

The designations employed and the presentation of material in this information product do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) concerning the legal or development status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The mention of specific companies or products of manufacturers, whether or not these have been patented, does not imply that these have been endorsed or recommended by FAO in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned.

The views expressed in this information product are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of FAO.

ISBN 978-92-5-106414-6

All rights reserved. FAO encourages reproduction and dissemination of material in this information product. Non-commercial uses will be authorized free of charge. Reproduction for resale or other commercial purposes, including educational purposes, may incur fees. Applications for permission to reproduce or disseminate FAO copyright materials and all other queries on rights and licences, should be addressed by e-mail to copyright@fao.org or to the Chief, Publishing Policy and Support Branch, Office of Knowledge Exchange, Research and Extension, FAO, Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy.

Preparation of this document

The need for a manual for decision-makers on understanding and applying risk analysis in aquaculture was discussed and guidance on its approach and contents formulated by the participants at the FAO/NACA Expert Workshop on Understanding and Applying Risk Analysis in Aquaculture, held from 8 to 11 June 2007 in Rayong, Thailand. The experts attending the Rayong workshop recognized that the aquaculture sector, which is characterized by a high diversity in operating systems, environments and species cultured, faced a wide range of biological, physical, chemical, economic and social risks to its successful and sustainable development. As a consequence, this document was prepared to provide policy-makers and senior managers who must deal with the rapid development of their national aquaculture sectors with a concise overview of risk analysis methodology as applied in seven key risk categories (pathogen, food safety and human health, genetic, environmental, ecological [pests and invasives], financial and social risks) and advice on the application of risk analysis at the national and farm levels can lead to a more sustainable aquaculture industry.

This document will also be of relevance to aquaculture operators, industry organizations, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and other groups interested in understanding risk analysis and its influences on national aquaculture policy, industry regulation and the management of aquatic resources.

This manual was developed under the technical supervision of Dr Melba B. Reantaso, Fishery Resources Officer, Aquaculture Management and Conservation Service, Fisheries and Aquaculture Management Division, FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Department. The manual draws heavily on the proceedings of the Rayong workshop (FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Technical Paper No. 519) and particularly on the review papers of M.G. Bondad-Reantaso and J.R. Arthur (pathogen risks), M.L. Campbell and C.L. Hewitt (environmental pest risks), I. Karunasagar (food safety and public health risks), E. Hallerman (genetic risks), M.J. Phillips and R.P. Subasinghe (environmental risks), K.M.Y. Leung and D. Dudgeon (ecological risks), L.E. Kam and P. Leung (financial risks) and P.B. Bueno (social risks).

Preparation and publication of this document were made possible with financial assistance through the Programme Cooperation Agreement of Norway under B.1 and D.1 objectives, through the FishCode Programme of the FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Department, the Nutrition and Consumer Protection Division and the Plant Production and Protection Division of the FAO Agriculture and Consumer Protection Department.

Abstract

Aquaculture is a rapidly expanding sector of the global economy with an average growth rate of 8.8 percent per annum since 1970. This consistent increase in production is a result of expansion of markets, globalization of market access and an increasing market demand for seafood products during a period in which most capture fisheries are stagnating or in decline. Aquaculture is expected to continue to increase its contribution to the world's production of aquatic food and will further strengthen its role in food security and food safety, while also offering opportunities to alleviate poverty, increase employment and community development and reduce overexploitation of natural aquatic resources, thus creating social and generational equity, particularly in developing countries.

This rapid development of the industry under various national and regional jurisdictions has resulted in a diversity of regulatory frameworks. Thus, FAO Members have requested guidance on the application of risk analysis with respect to aquaculture production. The purpose of this manual is to provide an overview of the risk analysis process as applied to aquaculture production and to demonstrate the variety of ways in which risk can manifest in aquaculture operations and management. The intention of this manual is to promote wider understanding and acceptance of the applications and benefits of risk analysis in aquaculture production and management.

This manual is directed towards decisions-makers and senior aquaculture managers in FAO Members States. It includes an introduction to the methodology used to assess the risks posed by aquaculture operations to the environment, socio-political and economic well-being and cultural values, as well as the risks to aquaculture from outside influences, including potential environmental, socio-political, economic and cultural impacts. The manual contains six sections. Section 1 provides a background to the aquaculture sector and an introduction to the concepts of risk analysis. Section 2 presents the operating environment for risk analysis for the aquaculture sector by briefly reviewing the relevant international frameworks applicable to each risk category. Section 3 discusses a general risk analysis process for aquaculture. Section 4 provides brief overviews of the risk analysis process as applied in each of the seven risk categories. Section 5 briefly summarizes actions that need to be taken by FAO Members to promote the wider use of risk analysis for aquaculture development. Finally, Section 6 discusses future challenges to aquaculture and the role risk analysis might play in addressing them.

Arthur, J.R.; Bondad-Reantaso, M.G.; Campbell, M.L.; Hewitt, C.L.; Phillips, M.J.; Subasinghe, R.P.

Understanding and applying risk analysis in aquaculture: a manual for decision-makers. *FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Technical Paper*. No. 519/1. Rome, FAO. 2009. 113p.

Contents

Preparation of this document	iii
Abstract	iv
Acknowledgements	V111
Abbreviations and acronyms	1X
Glossary	xi
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Purpose	2
1.3 Target audience	2
1.4 Scope	2
1.5 Structure of the manual	3
1.6 Concepts of risk Analysis	3
1.7 General framework of risk analysis	7
2. OPERATING ENVIRONMENT	11
2.1 Overview of regulatory frameworks	11
2.2 Overview of the key risk categories	18
3. A RISK ANALYSIS PROCESS FOR AQUACULTURE	27
3.1 Determining the scope of the risk analysis	27
3.2 Hazard identification	29
3.3 Risk assessment	32
3.4 Risk management	35
3.5 Risk communication	38
4. BRIEF OVERVIEW OF THE RISK ANALYSIS PROCESS BY RISK CATEGORY	41
4.1 Overview of the pathogen risk analysis process	41
4.2 Overview of the food safety and public health risk analysis process4.3 Overview of the ecological (pests and invasives) risk analysis	47
process	53
4.4 Overview of the genetic risk analysis process	68
4.5 Overview of the environmental risk analysis process	75
4.6 Overview of the financial risk analysis process	82
4.7 Overview of the social risk analysis process	90
5. IMPLEMENTATION OF RISK ANALYSIS IN AQUACULTURE	97
5.1 National policy level	97
6. FUTURE CHALLENGES	103
REFERENCES	107

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to acknowledge all participants at the FAO/NACA Expert Workshop on Understanding and Applying Risk Analysis in Aquaculture, held from 8 to 11 June 2007 in Rayong, Thailand. The authors also thank P. Appleford, J. Clay, T. Huntington, I. Karunasagar, Z. Mehmedbasic, P. Secretan, P. Sonsangjinda, M.R. Umesh and C. Wo Wing, who, as members of the working group on "Development of the Contents of the Manual on Understanding and Applying Risk Analysis in Aquaculture", developed the initial outline for this manual. The contributors of the review papers contained in the FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Technical Paper No. 519, from which this manual was based, are also gratefully acknowledged. They were P.B. Bueno, D. Dudgeon, E. Hallerman, L.E. Kam, I. Karunasagar, K.M.Y. Leung and P. Leung. In addition, thanks are also due to T. Farmer and F. Schatto (FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Information and Statistics Service) and J.L. Castilla (layout design) for various types of assistance during the final production and publication of this document. J. Jia (FAO Aquaculture Management and Conservation Service), I. Kollavik-Jensen (Programme Coordination Unit of FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Department), M. Robson and P. Kenmore (FAO Plant Production and Protection Division) are especially thanked for encouragement and for facilitating funding support to the project on Risk Analysis in Aquaculture Production.

Abbreviations and acronyms

ALARA as low as reasonably achieved (approach)

ALOP appropriate level of protection

ALOR acceptable level of risk
ANP analytic network process

APEC Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation
ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations

BMPs best management practices

CAC Codex Alimentarius Commission
CBD Convention on Biological Diversity

CCRF Code of Conduct for Responsible Fisheries

CSR corporate social responsibility
EIA environmental impact assessment

EIFAC European Inland Fisheries Advisory Commission (of the FAO) ERA ecological risk assessment; environmental risk assessment

EU European Union

FAO Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations

FSO food safety objective
GAP good aquaculture practices

GESAMP IMO/FAO/UNESCO-LOC/WMO/IAEA/UN/UNEP

Joint Group of Experts on the Scientific Aspects of Marine

Environmental Protection

GISD Global Invasive Species Database GMO genetically modified organism

HABs harmful algal blooms

HACCP Hazard Analysis And Critical Control Point Analysis ICES International Council for the Exploration of the Sea

ICPM Interim Commission on Phytosanitary Measures (of the IPPC)

IPPC International Plant Protection Convention

IRA import risk analysis
IRR internal rate of return

ISO International Standards Organisation

ISPM International Standards for Phytosanitary Measures

ISR International Sanitary Regulations
IUCN World Conservation Union

LIFDCs low-income food-deficit countries
MCMD multicriteria decision-making

MPEDA Marine Products Export Development Authority (India)

MOTAD minimization of total absolute deviations

NACA Network of Aquaculture Centres in Asia and the Pacific

NaCSA National Centre for Sustainable Aquaculture (India)
NEMESIS National Exotic Marine and Estuarine Species Information

System

NIMPIS National Introduced Marine Pest Information System

NGO Non-governmental organization

NPPOs National Plant Protection Organizations
OIE World Organisation for Animal Health

ORP organism risk potential

PAHO Pan American Health Organization

PRP pathway risk potential ROI return on investment PRA pathogen risk analysis

RPPOs Regional Plant Protection Organizations (of the IPPC)
SEAFDEC South East Asian Fisheries Development Center

SOPs standard operating procedures

SPS Sanitary and Phytosanitary (Agreement) (of the WTO)

SRM social risk management

TAADs transboundary aquatic animal diseases

TBT Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade (TBT Agreement)

UN United Nations

UNICLOS United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea USEPA United States Environmental Protection Agency

WGITMO Working Group on Introductions and Transfers of Marine

Organisms (of ICES)

WHO World Health Organization
WSD whitespot syndrome disease
WSSV whitespot syndrome virus
WTO World Trade Organization

Glossary

Appropriate level of protection (ALOP)

The level of protection deemed appropriate by a country establishing a sanitary or phytosanitary measure to protect identified or assessed values

Acceptable level of risk (ALOR)

The level of risk a country establishing a sanitary or phytosanitary measure is willing to assume to protect identified or assessed values

Biosecurity A strategic and integrated approach that

encompasses both policy and regulatory frameworks aimed at analyzing and managing the risks of the sectors dealing with food safety, animal life and health, plant life and health and the environment

Consequence The evaluated impact an event may have on assessed

values (environmental, economic, socio-political,

The process of evaluating the impact of an event.

cultural)

Consequence assessment

Cultural value Those aspects of the aquatic environment that

represent an iconic or spiritual value, including those that create a sense of local, regional or national

identity

Delphi process A semi-quantitative method from the social sciences

that is used to capture stakeholder and/or expert

opinions and beliefs

Economic value Components within an ecosystem that provide a

current or potential economic gain or loss

Environmental value Everything from the biological to physical

characteristics of an ecosystem being assessed, excluding extractive (economic) use and aesthetic

value

Exposure assessment The process of describing the mechanism or

pathway(s) necessary for an adverse event to occur and estimating the likelihood of that event occurring

Food safety

The process of ensuring that products for human

consumption meet or exceed standards of quality to ensure that human consumption will not result in

morbidity or mortality

Food security The protection and management of biological

resources for safe and sustainable human

consumption

Genetically modified organism (GMO)

An organism in which the genetic material has been altered by human intervention, generally through

use of recombinant DNA technologies

Hazard An organism, action or event that can produce

adverse consequences relative to the assessment

endpoint

Hazard identification The process of identifying events, actions or objects

that can potentially cause adverse consequences to

values

Impact The alteration or change in value caused by a hazard

Introduction The intentional or accidental transport and release

by humans of any species into an environment

outside its present range

Invasive species An organism that causes negative impact to

economic, environmental, socio-political or cultural values due to prolific growth and unmanaged

population

Likelihood Probability of an event occurring, ranging from rare

events to likely or frequent events

Non-indigenous species An organism that has been transferred to a location

in which it did not evolve or in which it was not

present in its historic range

Pathogen An infectious agent capable of causing disease

Pest An organism that causes harm to economic,

environmental, socio-political or cultural values

Precautionary An approach to risk management that takes into

approach account the precautionary principle

Precautionary principle The axiom that "a lack of full scientific certainty

shall not be used as a reason for postponing costeffective measures to prevent environmental

degradation" (CBD, 1992)

Quarantine The isolation of a region, area or group of organisms

to contain the spread or prevent the entry of something considered dangerous or likely to cause

harm (e.g. a pest or pathogen)

Release assessment The process of describing the pathway by which a

hazard is "released" into the operating environment of the risk analysis and estimating the likelihood of

this occurring

Risk The potential occurrence of unwanted, adverse

consequences associated with some action over a

specified time period

Risk analysis A detailed examination including risk assessment,

risk evaluation, and risk management alternatives, performed to understand the nature of unwanted, negative consequences to human life, health, property, or the environment in order to minimize

the risk

Risk assessment The process of assessing the likelihood and

consequence of an event

Risk communication The act or process of exchanging information

concerning risk

Risk management The pragmatic decision-making process concerned

with what to do about risk

Risk mitigation Actions or controls that, when put in place, will

alter, reduce or prevent either the likelihood or the consequence of an event, thus acting to reduce the

risk of an event

Socio-political value The value placed on a location in relation to human

use for pleasure, aesthetic or generational values. This value may also include human health and politics. Examples include tourism, family outings,

learning and aesthetics

Transfer The intentional or accidental transport and release of

any species within its present range