

**Project Evaluation Series**

# **Final evaluation of Pursuing Pastoralist Resilience through Improved Animal Health Service Delivery in Pastoralist Areas of Ethiopia**

**Project code: GCP/ETH/083/EC**

**Annex 7. Commentary on PPR Project logical frame**

**FOOD AND AGRICULTURE ORGANIZATION OF THE UNITED NATIONS  
Rome, 2020**



- The following two tables provide comment on the higher level assumptions and objectively verifiable indicators from the Project log frame.

<b>Project Log-frame higher level Assumptions</b>	<b>Evaluation Commentary</b>
Purpose	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No major conflict in &amp; migration from neighbouring countries.</li> <li>• No extreme droughts (water shortages) or floods during the implementation of the project in targeted areas.</li> <li>• Project approved and implemented in a timely manner.</li> <li>• Government stays committed to the eradication of PPR and the progressive control of SGP.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There is a refugee camp in north Afar but this does not appear to affect the Project.</li> <li>• Droughts but not considered extreme.</li> <li>• Long delay at start.</li> <li>• Government still has not ratified Ethiopia's Eradication Pathway document.</li> </ul>
Result 1	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Security situation remains stable to allow access to all districts for surveillance purposes.</li> <li>• GoE assures timely clearance of disease reports at all levels.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Project affected by delays in Somali and Somali/Oromia border.</li> <li>• Yes.</li> </ul>
Result 2	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• NVI continues to produce conventional PPR vaccine in sufficient quantities to supply the regional states.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Yes.</li> </ul>
Result 3	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The government provides sufficient quantities of quality thermostable PPR as well as conventional PPR and SGP vaccines for free.</li> <li>• The government continues its political and financial support to federal representation in the regional state bureaus of Afar, Oromia, Somali and SNNP regional states that assure the line of command for the implementation of the focussed progressive disease control programme.</li> <li>• Government adopts policy that allows private sector role in vaccination and prepared to provide sanitary mandates to the private sector.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Yes.</li> <li>• This hasn't happened, with significant impact on Project.</li> <li>• This hasn't happened.</li> </ul>

<b>Project Log-frame higher level Assumptions</b>	<b>Evaluation Commentary</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Government continues to allocate sufficient funding and staff to control PPR/ SGP in highland districts not covered by SHARE program.</li> <li>• The security situation remains stable to allow effective vaccination.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Security has affected some areas in Somali.</li> </ul>
Result 4	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• IGAD, AU-IBAR and FAO continue their efforts to jointly lobby for an expansion of the PPR/SGP control programme in the sub-region.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It is unclear how much independent funding IGAD and AU-IBAR have for this. The Project has funded regional meetings and lobbying.</li> </ul>

<b>Objectively Verifiable Indicators</b>	<b>Source of verification</b>	<b>Evaluation commentary</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mortality due to PPR reduced to zero in Afar Region by the end of year 4; The absence of PPR disease established in.</li> <li>• The mortality due to PPR and SGP in small ruminants in the remaining project areas (i.e., Somali Region, Borena and Guji Zones of Oromiya and South Omo zone of SNNPR) reduced to less than 1% and 2% respectively by the end of the project.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Results of participatory impact assessments on disease prevalence, and first results of serology in year 4 among the young stock in Afar.</li> <li>• Disease history survey reports and disease investigation reports. (The baseline mortality due to PPR in 2010 was about 10% in goats in areas endemic to PPR, while the mortality due to SGP was about 5%).</li> <li>• Biannual disease status reports.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Only one outbreak of PPR confirmed in Afar in each of 2018 &amp; 2019 so this may have been met, but no detailed evidence.</li> <li>• PDS quality still developing and PPR still around so unlikely to have been met.</li> </ul>

<b>Objectively Verifiable Indicators</b>	<b>Source of verification</b>	<b>Evaluation commentary</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• From every woreda where the mobile phone based disease notification system is established a minimum of 20 disease notifications or zero reports are received per mobile phone per month.</li> <li>• By the end of the project at least 80% of the districts included in the project area are included in the mobile phone based disease notification system.</li> <li>• At least 10 woredas included in the project area are surveyed and reported per month using participatory disease (history) survey techniques as of the 12th month of the project.</li> <li>• At least 20%, 50% and 75% of the notified suspected PPR and SGP outbreaks investigated and diagnosed by laboratory by year 2, 3 and 4 respectively within two weeks of receipt of the notification.</li> <li>• In line with the OIE requirements, transboundary animal disease outbreak reports are compiled and published on a bi-annual basis by the Animal Health Directorate.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Monthly disease notification statistics.</li> <li>• Participatory disease (history) survey reports.</li> <li>• Quarterly disease distribution maps based on information collected from disease history surveys and the database of disease notification reports.</li> <li>• Laboratory investigation protocols and reports.</li> <li>• OIE reports.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ADNIS not yet at this level.</li> <li>• ADNIS not yet developed to stage of being able to confirm this level of functional cover.</li> </ul> <p>(NB Bi-Annual Reports more useful)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• In 2018, target 120 woredas, 36 PDS exercises covering 69 woredas.</li> <li>• In Jan-June 2019, target 60 woredas, 35 PDS exercises covering 95 woredas.</li> <li>• Confirmation now immediate by pen-side test. Some samples still sent to NAHDIC but needs improved sample submission.</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• NVI produces at least 2mln, 5mln and 10mln doses of PANVAC certified thermo-stable PPR vaccine on an annual basis by Year 2, 3 and 4 respectively.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Report on the collaborative work between NVI and ILRI including consultant mission report .</li> <li>• NVI Annual reports.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Not achieved, but test batches meet PANVAC standard and by early 2020 equipment will be working to exceed the 10 million target.</li> <li>• This is a significant achievement by the Project with Donor support.</li> </ul>

Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Source of verification	Evaluation commentary
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• PANVAC technical reports on the quality and efficacy of PPR vaccines.</li> </ul>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Focused annual PPR and SGP vaccination response plans are in place and applied that are if required adjusted bi-annually during the bi-annual coordination meeting.</li> <li>• Annual maps (by the end of each financial) year showing the area endemic as well as the areas provisionally free from PPR and/or SGP.</li> <li>• Annual plan for the verification of absence of PPR disease in Afar region prepared and agreed by the end of year 3.</li> <li>• Frameworks or disease control strategies developed for SGP and CCPP and agreed by regional and federal governments by the end of year two.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Vaccination records/reports.</li> <li>• NVI vaccine distribution records.</li> <li>• Report on the vaccine delivery pilot study.</li> <li>• Antibody prevalence study reports.</li> <li>• Bi annual coordination meeting progress reports.</li> <li>• Annual maps showing the areas that are provisionally free from PPR.</li> <li>• Annual plan for the verification of absence of disease in Afar.</li> <li>• The actual frameworks and/or disease control strategy.</li> <li>• Proceedings of the workshops in which the regional state and federal veterinary services adopted the disease control strategies.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• These details are overly ambitious considering structure of NVS and amount of training and support required over an enormous geographical area.</li> <li>• Risk area maps are produced and update six-monthly.</li> <li>• Sheep and Goat Pox has featured little in the Project as it seems less prevalent and less feared by animal keepers.</li> </ul>

<b>Objectively Verifiable Indicators</b>	<b>Source of verification</b>	<b>Evaluation commentary</b>
<p>National</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Strategy adjustments and work plans reviewed, discussed and adopted on a bi-annual basis by the participants of regional (Afar, Somali, SNNPR and Oromiya) and federal coordination meetings that are conducted twice a year.</li> <li>• Annual work plans and possible mid-year adjustments agreed by the bi-annual steering committee meeting. (SCM are held after the coordination meetings).</li> </ul> <p>Regional (IGAD)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• At least two sub-regional PPR/SGP coordination meetings attended by Ethiopian veterinary staff and two sub-regional PPR/SGP coordination meetings co-hosted (AU-IBAR, IGAD/FAO-SFE) in Ethiopia with recommendations on the control of PPR and SGP adopted by year 2 and year 4 respectively.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Proceedings of the coordination meetings.</li> <li>• Minutes of steering meetings.</li> <li>• Project progress reports and proceedings of (sub-) regional coordination meetings.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Yes.</li> <li>• Yes.</li> <li>• Yes.</li> </ul>